

# Human Rights Law Journal · HRLJ

HRLJ

31 July 2025

Vol. 45 No. 1-7

ISSN 0174/4704

Pages 1-264

## 1. ARTICLES **Marc Bossuyt**, Antwerp

- Is the European System for Transfer of Asylum Seekers under the EU Dublin Regulation Sustainable? ..... 1

## 2. DECISIONS and REPORTS

### UN Human Rights Committee (UN-HRCee), Geneva

- 14.III.25 – Unlawful restrictions on freedom of expression and on freedom of movement / Prosecution of a lawyer and a journalist for criticising the Head of State / Use of travel bans and asset seizure before adjudication / Imposition of unprecedented large non-pecuniary damages / *Djakupova and Idinov v. Kyrgyzstan* ..... 8

### European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), Strasbourg

- 15.X.24 – Degrading treatment of a Syrian asylum-seeker / Twofold violation of Article 3 ECHR (different limbs) / Germany removed the applicant to Greece without discharging their *procedural* obligation / Greece detained the applicant for more than two months in a police station, a place *per se* designed to accommodate people for a short time only (*substantive* violation) / Greece in addition responsible for a violation of the right to have lawfulness of detention decided speedily by a court (Article 5 § 4 ECHR) / *H.T. v. Germany and Greece* ..... 13
- 7.I.25 – “Pushback” of Turkish national to Türkiye without examining risks she faced on her return, coupled with prior detention / The Court finds that a systematic practice of “pushbacks” from Greece to Türkiye is in place / Relevance of *prima facie* evidence provided by the applicant / Articles 3 and 13 as well as Article 5 ECHR violated / *A.R.E. v. Greece* ..... 30
- 23.I.25 – Insufficient procedural safeguards against partiality in the SJC (Armenian Supreme Judicial Council) / Dismissal of the applicant from his position as judge / Violation of Article 6 § 1 ECHR as regards the alleged lack of impartiality of the Chair of the SJC / *Suren Antonyan v. Armenia* ..... 62
- 11.II.25 – “NO TO WAR” not tolerated under new Russian legislation (of 4 March 2022) enacted after the beginning of the war (24 Feb. 2022) against Ukraine / Suppression of dissent in making it an offence to “discredit the military” or spread “fake news” / Two independent media organisations shut down and 178 applicants convicted either in criminal or administrative proceedings / Multiple violations of the Convention / *Novaya Gazeta et al. v. Russia* ..... 82
- 27.II.25 – Shortcomings in investigation into an alleged gang-rape accompanied by prejudicial gender stereotypes and victim-blaming attitudes / Violation of Article 3 (degrading treatment, lack of effective investigation) and Article 8 (right to respect for private life) / *X v. Cyprus* ..... 98
- 27.II.25 – Forced labour and sexual abuse (Article 4 ECHR) / here: Intellectually disabled woman / Removal from State care (“the asylum”) and placement on a private farm run by a couple “looking for a woman from the asylum to work at the farm and/or be another employee’s housewife or bride” / Deficiency in the “deinstitutionalisation” procedure: Couple’s request “should have been a red flag” / Violation of substantive and procedural limb of Article 4, of Articles 3 and 8 (degrading treatment, respect for private life), of Article 14 (discrimination) in conjunction with Articles 3, 4 and 8 ECHR / *I.C. v. Moldova* ..... 114

(Contents continued on the next page)



N. P. Engel, Publisher

www.hrlj.info

e-mail: N.P.Engel@HRLJ.info

# Human Rights Law Journal

HRLJ · and continuation of The Human Rights Review

*Editorial Advisory Board:*

Thomas Buergenthal†, Washington, D.C. · Tim Eicke, Strasbourg · Jochen Abr. Frowein, Heidelberg · Anatoly Kovler, Moscow · Paul Mahoney, Strasbourg · Jörg Paul Müller, Bern · Willibald P. Pahr, Vienna · Guido Raimondi, Rome · Sonia Picado Sotela, San José (Costa Rica) · The Right Hon. Lord Mance, London · William A. Schabas, London · Christian Tomuschat, Berlin

*Editor-in-Chief:* Erika Engel

*Associate Editor:* John Packer, Ottawa

## Table of Contents Vol. 45 (2025) No. 1-7 (continued)

<b>European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), Strasbourg</b>	
- 10.VII.25 – Refusal to comply with newly issued 2018 World Athletics regulations regarding athletes with “Differences in Sex Development” / Rejection of the applicant’s legal action by the Court of Arbitration (CAS, Lausanne) / Swiss Federal Supreme Court’s limited review of the CAS arbitral decision violates right to a fair hearing (Article 6 § 1 ECHR) / <i>Semenya v. Switzerland (GC)</i> ..	142
<b>Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU), Luxembourg</b>	
- 13.III.25 – Transgender identity / Hungarian asylum register / Rectification of data relating to gender identity cannot be made conditional upon proof of surgery / <i>Deldits</i> .....	190
- 29.IV.25 – Maltese investor citizenship scheme contrary to EU law / ‘Commercialisation’ of EU citizenship incompatible with the basic concept of Union citizenship as laid down in the Treaties / The investor citizenship scheme provides for the payment of substantial sums of money in the range of between EUR 600,000 and EUR 750,000 for direct investments or, for example, for the purchase of residential property valued at a minimum of EUR 700,000 / <i>Commission v. Malta</i>	195
<b>UK Supreme Court, London</b>	
- 24.IV.24 – “Limbo” status of an illegal immigrant / No obligation to grant an illegal immigrant access to the employment market / Interpretation of lawful restrictions to the right to respect for private life (Article 8 ECHR) / <i>Case of AM (Belarus)</i> .....	204
<b>German Federal Constitutional Court, Karlsruhe</b>	
- 1.XI.24 – Conviction for drug trafficking based on decrypted EncroChat data / Use of evidence sourced abroad and introduced into German criminal proceedings / Summary of the relevant case-law, also in respect of the duty of referral under Article 267(3) TFEU / Reference to the EncroChat judgment of the CJEU (of 30 April 2024, C-670/22) / <i>EncroChat data case</i> .....	220
- 14.I.25 – Additional policing costs for “high-risk football matches” prone to violence between rival fan groups / Costs may be shifted to organisers of large-scale, for-profit events with more than 5,000 participants / here: <i>Bundesliga</i> match in Bremen on 19 April 2015 (additional 969 police officers deployed, costs: EUR 425,718.11) / Constitutional complaint rejected .....	227
<b>3. DOCUMENTATION</b>	
<b>European Union</b>	
- 22.V.25 – Open letter of nine EU Presidents and Prime Ministers / Criticism of the case-law of the ECtHR	238
<b>4. PENDING PROCEEDINGS</b>	
<b>Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU), Luxembourg</b>	
- 5.VI.25 – EU’s fundamental values: Advocate General Ćapeta pleads for the justiciability of Article 2 TEU and proposes that the action brought by the Commission is well-founded in relation to all grounds / Denial of EU’s values unacceptable / here: National laws intended to protect minors from LGBTI content / Case C-769/22, <i>Commission v. Hungary</i> .....	240



Human rights law journal @ N.P. Engel Verlag  
Reproduced with permission of Engel Verlag