



KEY CASES

2019



List of cases recommended
by the Jurisconsult and
approved by the Bureau

European Court of Human Rights

January 2020

NOTE ON CITATION

Cases are listed by reference to the relevant Convention Articles and alphabetically by applicant and by respondent State.

By default, all references are to Chamber judgments. Grand Chamber cases, whether judgments or decisions, are indicated by “[GC]”. Decisions are indicated by “(dec.)”.

Chamber judgments that are not yet “final” within the meaning of Article 44 of the Convention are marked “(not final)”. In the event that any such judgment is accepted for referral to the Grand Chamber in accordance with Article 43, it will not be included in the present list.

For information on the manner of citing the Court’s case-law, please see [here](#).

Article 44 § 2

The judgment of a Chamber shall become final

- (a) when the parties declare that they will not request that the case be referred to the Grand Chamber; or
- (b) three months after the date of the judgment, if reference of the case to the Grand Chamber has not been requested; or
- (c) when the panel of the Grand Chamber rejects the request to refer under Article 43.

Article 43

1. Within a period of three months from the date of the judgment of the Chamber, any party to the case may, in exceptional cases, request that the case be referred to the Grand Chamber.
2. A panel of five judges of the Grand Chamber shall accept the request if the case raises a serious question affecting the interpretation or application of the Convention or the Protocols thereto, or a serious issue of general importance.
3. If the panel accepts the request, the Grand Chamber shall decide the case by means of a judgment.

Contents

CASES BY ARTICLE	4
CASES BY APPLICANT	9
CASES BY STATE	11

Cases by Article

ARTICLE 2

LIFE | POSITIVE OBLIGATIONS (SUBSTANTIVE ASPECT)

Suicide of a mentally ill man voluntarily admitted to State psychiatric hospital for treatment after suicide attempt: *no violation*

Fernandes de Oliveira v. Portugal [GC], 78103/14, 31 January 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

EFFECTIVE INVESTIGATION

Alleged failure to conduct effective investigation into road-traffic accident in which an individual sustained unintentional life-threatening injuries: *Article 2 applicable; no violation*

Nicolae Virgiliu Tănase v. Romania [GC], no. 41720/13, 25 June 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

EFFECTIVE INVESTIGATION | POSITIVE OBLIGATIONS (PROCEDURAL ASPECT)

Cyprus' refusal to waive its criminal jurisdiction in favour of the "TRNC" courts: *no violation*

Failure of Turkey to cooperate with Cyprus in murder investigation: *violation*

Güzelyurtlu and Others v. Cyprus and Turkey [GC], no. 36925/07, 29 January 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Scope of a State's procedural obligation to co-operate with another State investigating a murder committed within the latter's jurisdiction: *violation*

Romeo Castaño v. Belgium, no. 8351/17, 9 July 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Osman v. the United Kingdom principles applied in a kidnapping context: *violation*

Olewnik-Cieplińska and Olewnik v. Poland, no. 20147/15, 5 September 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 3

INHUMAN OR DEGRADING TREATMENT

Reducibility of a whole-life prison sentence imposed for leadership of a Mafia organisation depended on cooperation with the police: *violation*

Marcello Viola v. Italy (no. 2), no. 77633/16, 13 June 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

INHUMAN OR DEGRADING TREATMENT

Alleged failure to conduct effective investigation into road-traffic accident in which an individual sustained unintentional life-threatening injuries: *Article 3 not applicable*

Nicolae Virgiliu Tănase v. Romania [GC], no. 41720/13, 25 June 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

DEGRADING TREATMENT

Precarious living conditions of unaccompanied foreign minor in a shanty town and failure to execute judicial placement order: *violation*

Khan v. France, no. 12267/16, 28 February 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

EXPULSION

Short-term confinement of asylum seekers in a land border transit zone and subsequent removal to a third country presumed safe, without examining their asylum claims on the merits

Ilias and Ahmed v. Hungary [GC], no. 47287/15, 21 November 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 5

Article 5 § 1

PERSONS OF UNSOUND MIND

Obligation of means in overcoming a linguistic obstacle to treatment of the mental disorders suffered by an individual in compulsory confinement: *violation; no violation*

Rooman v. Belgium [GC], no. 18052/11, 31 January 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

DEPRIVATION OF LIBERTY

Whether the confinement of foreigners in an airport transit zone amounted to a deprivation of their liberty

Z.A. and Others v. Russia [GC], nos. 61411/15 and 3 others, 21 November 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 6

Article 6 § 1 (civil)

ORAL HEARING

Proceedings brought by prison authorities, requesting presence of official during prisoner's consultations with lawyer, held without oral hearing or seeking submissions: *violation*

Altay v. Turkey (no. 2), no. 11236/09, 9 April 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Article 6 § 3 (b)

ADEQUATE FACILITIES

Defence denied access to mass of data and involvement in its electronic sifting by prosecution when gathering relevant information for investigation: *no violation*

Sigurður Einarsson and Others v. Iceland, no. 39757/15, 4 June 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 8

RESPECT FOR PRIVATE LIFE

Order to provide genetic sample in context of paternity proceedings: *no violation*

Mifsud v. Malta, no. 62257/15, 29 January 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

RESPECT FOR PRIVATE LIFE

Power of border control officials to stop and question without suspicion or access to lawyer: *violation*

Beghal v. the United Kingdom, no. 4755/16, 28 February 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

RESPECT FOR PRIVATE LIFE

Official present during consultations between prisoner and his lawyer: *violation*

Altay v. Turkey (no. 2), no. 11236/09, 9 April 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

RESPECT FOR PRIVATE LIFE

Advisory opinion concerning the recognition in domestic law of a legal parent-child relationship between a child born through a gestational surrogacy arrangement abroad and the intended mother

Advisory opinion requested by the French Court of Cassation [GC], request no. P16-2018-001, 10 April 2019

[Opinion](#) | [Legal summary](#)

RESPECT FOR PRIVATE LIFE

Alleged failure to conduct effective investigation into road-traffic accident in which an individual sustained unintentional life-threatening injuries: *Article 8 not applicable*

Nicolae Virgiliu Tănase v. Romania [GC], no. 41720/13, 25 June 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

RESPECT FOR FAMILY LIFE

An employee's right to respect for private life in the workplace and the limits of the employer's right to conduct video-surveillance

López Ribalda and Others v. Spain [GC], nos. 1874/13 and 8567/13, 17 October 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

RESPECT FOR FAMILY LIFE

Shortcomings in the decision-making process resulting in adoption of a vulnerable child by foster parents: *violation*

Strand Lobben and Others v. Norway [GC], no. 37283/13, 10 September 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Refusal to allow a prisoner convicted of terrorist offences to leave prison under escort to pay her respects to her late father: *no violation*

Guimon v. France, no. 48798/14, 11 April 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 13

RIGHT TO AN EFFECTIVE REMEDY

Relationship between preventive and compensatory remedies for conditions of detention which breach Article 3 of the Convention

Ulemek v. Croatia, no. 21613/16, 31 October 2019 (not final)

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 14

PROHIBITION OF DISCRIMINATION

The test to be applied as regards the justification for a measure of social and economic policy (“very weighty reasons” or “manifestly without reasonable foundation”)

J.D. and A v. the United Kingdom, nos. 32949/17 and 34614/17, 24 October 2019 (not final)

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 37

STRIKING OUT APPLICATIONS

Unilateral declarations containing no undertaking to reopen investigation in cases where such reopening was *de jure* or *de facto* impossible: *struck out*

Taşdemir v. Turkey, no. 52538/09, 12 March 2019
Kutlu and Others v. Turkey, no. 18357/11, 12 March 2019
Karaca v. Turkey, no. 5809/13, 12 March 2019

[Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 41

JUST SATISFACTION

Quantification and identification of victims eligible for compensation in respect of non-pecuniary damage in an inter-State case

Georgia v. Russia (I) (just satisfaction) [GC], no. 13255/07, 29 January 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 46

Article 46 § 4

INFRINGEMENT PROCEEDINGS

Infringement proceedings against Azerbaijan for failure to abide by final judgment of the European Court: *violation*

Ilgar Mammadov v. Azerbaijan [GC], no. 15172/13, 29 May 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL No. 7

RIGHT NOT TO BE TRIED OR PUNISHED TWICE

Criteria for determining whether a decision constitutes an “acquittal” or a “conviction” and whether it is “final”: *violation*

Mihalache v. Romania [GC], no. 54012/10, 8 July 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Cases by applicant

A

Advisory opinion requested by the French Court of Cassation, request no. P16-2018-001, 10 April 2019

[Opinion](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Altay v. Turkey (no. 2), no. 11236/09, 9 April 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

B

Beghal v. the United Kingdom, no. 4755/16, 28 February 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

F

Fernandes de Oliveira v. Portugal [GC], 78103/14, 31 January 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

G

Georgia v. Russia (I) (just satisfaction) [GC], no. 13255/07, 29 January 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Guimon v. France, no. 48798/14, 11 April 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Güzelyurtlu and Others v. Cyprus and Turkey [GC], no. 36925/07, 29 January 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

I

Ilgar Mammadov v. Azerbaijan [GC], no. 15172/13, 29 May 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Ilias and Ahmed v. Hungary [GC], no. 47287/15, 21 November 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

J

J.D. and A v. the United Kingdom, nos. 32949/17 and 34614/17, 24 October 2019 (not final)

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

K

Karaca v. Turkey, no. 5809/13, 12 March 2019

[Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Khan v. France, no. 12267/16, 28 February 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Kutlu and Others v. Turkey, no. 18357/11, 12 March 2019

[Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

L

López Ribalda and Others v. Spain [GC], nos. 1874/13 and 8567/13, 17 October 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

M

Marcello Viola v. Italy (no. 2), no. 77633/16, 13 June 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Mifsud v. Malta, no. 62257/15, 29 January 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Mihalache v. Romania [GC], no. 54012/10, 8 July 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

N

Nicolae Virgiliu Tănase v. Romania [GC], no. 41720/13, 25 June 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

O

Olewnik-Cieplińska and Olewnik v. Poland, no. 20147/15, 5 September 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

R

Rooman v. Belgium [GC], no. 18052/11, 31 January 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Romeo Castaño v. Belgium, no. 8351/17, 9 July 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

S

Sigurður Einarsson and Others v. Iceland,
no. 39757/15, 4 June 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Strand Lobben and Others v. Norway [GC],
no. 37283/13, 10 September 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

T

Taşdemir v. Turkey, no. 52538/09, 12 March 2019

[Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

U

Ulemek v. Croatia, no. 21613/16,
31 October 2019 (not final)

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Z

Z.A. and Others v. Russia [GC], nos. 61411/15
and 3 others, 21 November 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Cases by State

AZERBAIJAN

Ilgar Mammadov v. Azerbaijan [GC],
no. 15172/13, 29 May 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

BELGIUM

Rooman v. Belgium [GC],
no. 18052/11, 31 January 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Romeo Castaño v. Belgium, no. 8351/17, 9 July 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

CROATIA

Ulemek v. Croatia, no. 21613/16,
31 October 2019 (not final)

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

CYPRUS

Güzelyurtlu and Others v. Cyprus and Turkey
[GC], no. 36925/07, 29 January 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

FRANCE

Advisory opinion requested by the French Court of
Cassation, request no. P16-2018-001, 10 April 2019

[Opinion](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Guimon v. France, no. 48798/14, 11 April 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Khan v. France, no. 12267/16, 28 February 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

HUNGARY

Ilias and Ahmed v. Hungary [GC],
no. 47287/15, 21 November 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ICELAND

Sigurður Einarsson and Others v. Iceland,
no. 39757/15, 4 June 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ITALY

Marcello Viola v. Italy (no. 2),
no. 77633/16, 13 June 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

MALTA

Mifsud v. Malta, no. 62257/15, 29 January 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

NORWAY

Strand Lobben and Others v. Norway [GC],
no. 37283/13, 10 September 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

POLAND

Olewnik-Cieplińska and Olewnik v. Poland,
no. 20147/15, 5 September 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

PORTUGAL

Fernandes de Oliveira v. Portugal
[GC], 78103/14, 31 January 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

ROMANIA

Mihalache v. Romania [GC],
no. 54012/10, 8 July 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Nicolae Virgiliu Tănase v. Romania
[GC], no. 41720/13, 25 June 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

RUSSIA

Georgia v. Russia (I) (just satisfaction)
[GC], no. 13255/07, 29 January 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Z.A. and Others v. Russia [GC], nos. 61411/15
and 3 others, 21 November 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

SPAIN

López Ribalda and Others v. Spain [GC],
nos. 1874/13 and 8567/13, 17 October 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

TURKEY

Altay v. Turkey (no. 2), no. 11236/09, 9 April 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Güzelyurtlu and Others v. Cyprus and Turkey
[GC], no. 36925/07, 29 January 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Karaca v. Turkey, no. 5809/13, 12 March 2019

[Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Kutlu and Others v. Turkey,
no. 18357/11, 12 March 2019

[Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

Taşdemir v. Turkey, no. 52538/09, 12 March 2019

[Decision](#) | [Legal summary](#)

UNITED KINGDOM

Beghal v. the United Kingdom,
no. 4755/16, 28 February 2019

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)

J.D. and A v. the United Kingdom, nos. 32949/17
and 34614/17, 24 October 2019 (not final)

[Judgment](#) | [Legal summary](#)