

CASE-LAW INFORMATION, TRAINING AND OUTREACH

1. Introduction¹

One of the Court's core objectives, in line with the Interlaken, İzmir and Brighton Declarations, is to improve the accessibility to and understanding of leading Convention principles and standards in order to facilitate their implementation at national level. There is a particularly strong need for such improvement in those Council of Europe member States where neither of the Court's official languages (English and French) is sufficiently understood. Indeed, the Brighton Declaration encouraged the States Parties to ensure "that significant judgments of the Court are translated or summarised into national languages where this is necessary for them to be properly taken into account" (see point 9 d) i) of the Declaration).

In order to implement this objective of "bringing the Convention closer to home", the Court has initiated an ambitious case-law information, training and outreach programme. The programme has gathered pace and become increasingly proactive. The launch of the completely redesigned HUDOC database in 2012 has been followed by a further series of notable developments in 2013, including new print and digital collections of the leading cases in the *Reports of Judgments and Decisions* series; a new and improved Court website; a vast increase in the number of materials available in non-official languages; the publication of new Convention case-law guides and of a second Handbook, on European law; and the addition of a Turkish interface to the HUDOC database. In parallel, the Registry is increasingly forming partnerships with Governments and others who share the objective of ensuring better national-level understanding and implementation of key Europe-wide standards in the field of human rights and fundamental freedoms.

2. Dissemination of the Court's case-law

2.1. New print and digital collections of the leading cases

Every year, the Bureau of the Court selects approximately thirty of the most important cases for publication in the *Reports of Judgments and*

1. For more information, please see the regularly updated document "Recent ECHR developments in the areas of case-law information, training and general outreach" (available on the Court's website (www.echr.coe.int) under [Case-Law/Judgments and Decisions](#)).

Decisions, an official Court publication designed primarily for legal professionals, libraries and academics.²

In 2013 the Registry signed a contract with a new publisher (Wolf Legal Publishers in the Netherlands) for the print edition of the *Reports* in a partnership that allows for an accelerated publication pace and offers print-on-demand solutions to those interested in specific volumes and/or smaller print runs.

In addition to the print format, the *Reports* volumes, including past volumes dating back to 1999, have now been published online in a new e-Reports collection which is regularly updated and will ultimately become available across a range of electronic devices (see the Court's website under [Case-Law/Judgments and Decisions](#)).

At present, the *Reports* are published in five or six bilingual (English-French) volumes per year accompanied by an index. However, starting with the 2013 edition (scheduled for publication in 2014), separate monolingual editions will also be available. The Registry is also looking for partners interested in publishing the *Reports* in other languages.

2.2. HUDOC

In 2012 the Registry replaced its HUDOC database (<http://hudoc.echr.coe.int>) with a new, completely redesigned system intended to make the process of searching the Court's case-law simpler and more effective. Further improvements were rolled out in 2013.³

In addition a Turkish HUDOC interface was launched in November 2013 and now contains over 2,600 texts in that language, thanks to contributions from Turkey and the Human Rights Trust Fund (HRTF – www.coe.int/humanrightstrustfund).

A Russian version is planned for the first quarter of 2014. Discussions are under way with various other member States that have expressed an interest in assisting the Registry in creating an interface in their national languages.

2.3. Case-law translations programme

As noted above, a need has been identified to improve accessibility and understanding of the main Convention principles and standards in member States where neither of the Court's official languages is sufficiently understood.

2. For the list of cases selected for 2013, please see the Appendix at the end of this chapter. Quarterly updates to the lists of cases selected for publication in the Reports can be found on the Court's website under [Case-Law/Judgments and Decisions/Reports of Judgments and Decisions](#).

3. FAQs, manuals and video tutorials on HUDOC are available on the Court's website under [Case-Law/HUDOC/HUDOC Help](#).

In order to address this issue, the Registry launched a specific project in 2012 for translating key case-law – principally the leading cases selected by the Bureau – into twelve target languages with the support of the HRTE. The beneficiary States of this three-year project are Albania, Armenia, Azerbaijan, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Georgia, the Republic of Moldova, Montenegro, Serbia, “the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia”, Turkey and Ukraine. Since the beginning of this project, some 2,500 translations have been commissioned.

In addition to the languages covered by the HRTE-supported project, the Registry has also outsourced case-law translations into Bulgarian, Greek, Hungarian, Russian and Spanish.⁴

The translations, which are commissioned from external translators, are included in the HUDOC database and further disseminated by national-level partners.⁵ The Registry has extended a standing invitation to Governments, judicial training centres, associations of legal professionals, NGOs and other partners to offer, for inclusion in HUDOC, any case-law translations to which they have the rights. The Registry also references on its website third-party sites hosting translations of the Court’s case-law and welcomes suggestions for the inclusion of further sites.⁶

As a result of the translations programme, over 10,000 texts in twenty-seven languages (other than English and French) have now been made available in HUDOC, which is increasingly serving as a one-stop shop for translations of the Court’s case-law. The language-specific filter in HUDOC allows for rapid searching of these translations, including in free text. These texts now amount to about 10% of all HUDOC content.

With the HRTE-supported project due to end in April 2015, the long-term effectiveness of the translation programme will ultimately depend on partner institutions being found in each member State able to take responsibility for organising the translations into the national language(s). To that end, the Registrar of the Court wrote to all States in September 2013 to suggest that they consider arranging, with effect from 2015, the translation of those cases which the Court’s Bureau considers to be of Europe-wide importance. A number of States have already responded positively.

4. For more information, including the lists of project partners and translated case-law by beneficiary State, see the Court’s website under [Case-Law/Judgments and Decisions/Case-law translations](#).

5. The translations are published with a disclaimer since the only authentic language version(s) of a judgment or decision will be in either or both of the Court’s official languages.

6. More information can be found on the Court’s website under [Case-Law/Judgments and Decisions/Case-law translations/Existing translations/External online collections of translations](#); scroll down to see the list of third-party sites.

2.4. Other publications

2.4.1. Case-law Information Note

The Case-law Information Note continues to provide a monthly round-up of the most significant developments in the Court's case-law in the form of summaries of cases of particular jurisprudential interest. The individual summaries are also available (as 'Legal Summaries') in the HUDOC database, where they are fully searchable.

The complete Information Notes can be found on the Court's website under [Case-Law/Case-Law Analysis/Case-Law Information Note](#) and a subscription option is available for the paper version.

2.4.2. Research Division Guides and Reports

The Research Division is attached to the Jurisconsult's Office and its principal task is to provide research reports to assist the Grand Chamber and Sections in the examination of pending cases. In 2013 the Division prepared a total of fifty-six reports (twenty-five on the Court's case-law, fourteen on international law and seventeen on comparative law). A total of eleven research reports have now been made available to the public ([Case-Law/Case-Law Analysis/Case-law research reports](#)).

The Research Division also produced two new case-law guides in 2013, one on Article 4 of the Convention, the other on the civil-law aspects of Article 6, to follow up on its guide to Article 5 released in 2012 ([Case-Law/Case-Law Analysis/Case-law guides](#)). The next guide will cover the criminal-law aspects of Article 6.

The Practical Guide on Admissibility Criteria has now been translated into over twenty languages ([Case-Law/Case-law Analysis/Admissibility guide](#)). A third edition is planned for 2014.

2.4.3. Handbooks published with the European Union Fundamental Rights Agency

In June 2013 the Court and the Fundamental Rights Agency of the European Union launched the *Handbook on European law relating to asylum, borders and immigration*. This Handbook, which is the second in the series, is currently available in English, French, German and Italian, to be followed by around ten more language versions in 2014.⁷ This and the previous Handbook – on European non-discrimination law – are available online (under [Case-Law/Case-Law Analysis](#)).

7. The first Handbook copublished with FRA – on European non-discrimination law – has now been published in twenty-five languages. A first update was published in 2012 (in a few languages only) and a second update is under consideration.

Further Handbooks – on data protection and children’s rights – are scheduled for 2014 and 2015 respectively, in cooperation with the relevant departments of the Council of Europe.

2.4.4. Factsheets and Country Profiles

The Press Unit has now prepared a total of fifty-five Factsheets in English and French, many of which have been translated into German, Italian, Polish, Romanian, Russian and Turkish with the support of the Governments concerned.

It has also prepared Country Profiles covering each of the forty-seven member States. In addition to general and statistical information on each State, the Country Profiles provide résumés of the most noteworthy cases concerning that State.

The Factsheets and Country Profiles are available online ([Press/Press Resources/Factsheets](#) and [Press/Press Resources/Country profiles](#)).

3. Training of legal professionals

In 2013 the Registry pursued its project for providing targeted training to judges and other legal professionals in specific countries with the support of the HRTE. As part of this project a Training Unit was set up in the Registry in February 2012. The target countries are, for the time being, Albania, Armenia, Azerbaijan, Georgia, the Republic of Moldova, Montenegro, Serbia and Ukraine.

The project seeks to develop further the professional training that the Court and its Registry were already providing before the Training Unit was set up. The trainers are selected both from the ranks of serving judges and Registry lawyers as well as from among retired judges. The two-day sessions are held on the Court’s premises and include attendance at a hearing; a briefing on the case being heard; a meeting with the judge elected in respect of the member State in which the visiting professionals practise; and presentations on the main provisions of the Convention, the role of the Council of Europe Department for the Execution of Court Judgments, and the work of the Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment.

In 2013 four training sessions were organised for participants from Georgia, the Republic of Moldova, Montenegro and Ukraine.

In addition to the training sessions organised with the support of the HRTE, the Court organises targeted training programmes for magistrates and prosecutors, held over one to four days. In 2013 the Court organised forty-eight such programmes for delegations of seventeen of the forty-seven member States.

In cooperation with the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe, a training programme was also prepared for staff members of national Parliaments. A second training programme is being prepared for 2014.

4. General outreach

4.1. New Internet platform and Twitter account

The focal point of the Court's communication policy is its website, which recorded a total of 5,750,000 visits in 2013 (a 19% increase compared with 2012). The website provides a wide range of information on all aspects of the Court's work, including the latest news on its activities and cases; details of the Court's composition, organisation and procedure; Court publications and core Convention materials; statistical and other reports; and information for potential applicants and visitors.

In 2013 the Court migrated to a new Internet platform using mobile responsive design better adapted to mobile devices. The Court has also opened a Twitter account (https://twitter.com/ECHR_Press) in order to communicate more widely and proactively on recent cases, publications and other significant developments.

Lastly, the website provides a gateway to the Court library website, which, though specialised in human rights law, also has materials on comparative law and public international law. The library website was consulted over 40,500 times in 2013, and its online catalogue, containing references to the secondary literature on the Convention case-law and Articles, almost 300,000 times.

4.2. Public-relations materials

The Public Relations Unit produces information on the Court's activities for the general public and, in particular, applicants.

In 2013 the Unit produced a series of general publications on the Court's activities, including *The ECHR in facts and figures 2012* and *Overview 1959-2012*, which provide statistics on cases that have come before the Court and the number of judgments delivered, together with a breakdown of violations classified by subject matter, Convention Article and State. It also published the *Dialogue between judges 2013*, including the seminar to mark the opening of the Court's judicial year, on CD-ROM and in other formats.

A new leaflet – *Your application to the ECHR* – was also published, setting out the various stages of the Court's proceedings and answering questions frequently asked by applicants regarding, in particular, how an application is processed once it has been sent off.

The Public Relations Unit also produces multimedia materials. In 2013 it created a video tutorial explaining how to complete the application form correctly in order to assist applicants in their dealings with the Court and in complying with the procedural requirements for making a valid application. The video is already available in six languages (English, French, Romanian, Russian, Turkish and Ukrainian). The Court's video clip indicating the conditions of admissibility to potential applicants has also been made available in a further ten languages, making a total of thirty-one language versions in all.

In order to help spread awareness of the Convention system still further, existing materials giving general information on the Court have been translated into two new languages: Arabic (as part of the Court's translation project) and Japanese (courtesy of the Japanese Consul). The Court's basic information documents are now available in a total of forty-one languages.

The Court is increasingly making use of its YouTube channel (www.youtube.com/user/EuropeanCourt) for publishing videos and other training and outreach material with voice-overs into Council of Europe member State languages.

4.3. Anniversary book⁸

In April 2013 the Court, in cooperation with the publishing house iRGa5, launched the Russian edition of *The Conscience of Europe: 50 Years of the European Court of Human Rights*. This edition contains updated and additional content tailored to the Russian-speaking readership. Publication was supported by the Supreme Court and the Prosecutor General's Office of the Russian Federation. These institutions are also helping to disseminate the book in Russian legal circles, including to some 5,000 courts and prosecutor's offices throughout Russia. Excerpts from the Russian edition will be published online in the near future.

4.4. Visits

In 2013 the Visitors' Unit of the Court also organised 463 information visits for a total of 13,787 legal professionals and law students. In all, it welcomed a total of 18,973 visitors (compared with 19,099 in 2012).

8. The Court's anniversary book was first published in English and French in 2011 – with the help of a generous contribution from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Grand Duchy of Luxembourg – to conclude the celebrations marking the Court's 50th anniversary in 2009 and the 60th anniversary of the European Convention on Human Rights in 2010. These editions are no longer available from the publisher, but have been published online ([Publications/Anniversary Book: The Conscience of Europe](#)).

4.5. Video-conferencing and future-proofing

The Court is increasing its use of video-conferencing for the purposes of providing training and updates on its case-law. Preparations are also under way to make more material available in new formats compatible with devices such as e-readers, tablets and smartphones.

Appendix

Cases selected for publication in the *Reports of Judgments and Decisions 2013*⁹

Notes on citation:

Cases are listed alphabetically by respondent State.

By default, all references are to Chamber judgments. Grand Chamber cases, whether judgments or decisions, are indicated by “[GC]”. Decisions are indicated by “(dec.)”. Chamber judgments that are not yet “final” within the meaning of Article 44 of the Convention¹⁰ are marked “(not final)”. In the event that any such judgment is accepted for referral to the Grand Chamber in accordance with Article 43¹¹, it will not be published in the *Reports of Judgments and Decisions 2013*, but will be replaced by a judgment or decision from the “Reserve list”.

The Court reserves the right to report some or all of the judgments and decisions listed below in the form of extracts. The full original language version or versions of any such judgment or decision will remain available for consultation in the HUDOC database.

2013

Austria

X and Others v. Austria [GC], no. 19010/07, 19 February 2013

Bosnia and Herzegovina

Maktouf and Damjanović v. Bosnia and Herzegovina [GC], nos. 2312/08 and 34179/08, 18 July 2013 (extracts)

Bulgaria

Gutsanovi v. Bulgaria, no. 34529/10, 15 October 2013 (extracts)

Czech Republic

Lavrechov v. the Czech Republic, no. 57404/08, 20 June 2013

Cyprus

M.A. v. Cyprus, no. 41872/10, 23 July 2013 (extracts)

9. List approved by the Bureau following recommendation by the Court’s Jurisconsult.

10. Article 44 § 2 of the Convention provides: “The judgment of a Chamber shall become final (a) when the parties declare that they will not request that the case be referred to the Grand Chamber; or (b) three months after the date of the judgment, if reference of the case to the Grand Chamber has not been requested; or (c) when the panel of the Grand Chamber rejects the request to refer under Article 43.”

11. Article 43 §§ 1 and 2 of the Convention provide:

“1. Within a period of three months from the date of the judgment of the Chamber, any party to the case may, in exceptional cases, request that the case be referred to the Grand Chamber.

2. A panel of five judges of the Grand Chamber shall accept the request if the case raises a serious question affecting the interpretation or application of the Convention or the Protocols thereto, or a serious issue of general importance.”

France

Fabris v. France [GC], no. 16574/08, 7 February 2013 (extracts)

Greece

Zolotas v. Greece (no. 2), no. 66610/09, 29 January 2013 (extracts)

I.B. v. Greece, no. 552/10, 3 October 2013

Vallianatos and Others v. Greece [GC], nos. 29381/09 and 32684/09,
7 November 2013

Italy

Tarantino and Others v. Italy, nos. 25851/09, 29284/09 and 64090/09,
2 April 2013 (extracts)

Hungary

Vona v. Hungary, no. 35943/10, 9 July 2013

Latvia

X v. Latvia [GC], no. 27853/09, 26 November 2013

Netherlands

Stichting Mothers of Srebrenica and Others v. the Netherlands (dec.),
no. 65542/12, 11 June 2013 (extracts)

Romania

Sindicatul “Păstorul cel Bun” v. Romania [GC], no. 2330/09, 9 July 2013
(extracts)

Russia

Savriiddin Dzhurayev v. Russia, no. 71386/10, 25 April 2013 (extracts)

Sabanchiyeva and Others v. Russia, no. 38450/05, 6 June 2013 (extracts)

Janowiec and Others v. Russia [GC], nos. 55508/07 and 29520/09,
21 October 2013

Serbia

Zorica Jovanović v. Serbia, no. 21794/08, 26 March 2013

Spain

Del Río Prada v. Spain [GC], no. 42750/09, 21 October 2013

Sweden

Söderman v. Sweden [GC], no. 5786/08, 12 November 2013

Switzerland

Al-Dulimi and Montana Management Inc. v. Switzerland, no. 5809/08,
26 November 2013 (not final)

Perinçek v. Switzerland, no. 27510/08, 17 December 2013 (not final)

Turkey

Mehmet Şentürk v. Turkey, no. 13423/09, 9 April 2013

Ukraine

Oleksandr Volkov v. Ukraine, no. 21722/11, 9 January 2013

United Kingdom

Willcox and Hurford v. the United Kingdom (dec.), nos. 43759/10 and 43771/12, 8 January 2013

Eweida and Others v. the United Kingdom, no. 48420/10, 15 January 2013 (extracts)

Animal Defenders International v. the United Kingdom [GC], no. 48876/08, 22 April 2013 (extracts)

Vinter and Others v. the United Kingdom [GC], nos. 66069/09, 130/10 and 3896/10, 9 July 2013 (extracts)

Allen v. the United Kingdom [GC], no. 25424/09, 12 July 2010

Reserve list

Azerbaijan

Gahramanov v. Azerbaijan (dec.), no. 26291/06, 15 October 2013

Russia

Yefimenko v. Russia, no. 152/04, 12 February 2013 (extracts)

Blokhin v. Russia, no. 47152/06, 14 November 2013 (extracts)

Spain

García Mateos v. Spain, no. 38285/09, 19 February 2013 (extracts)

United Kingdom

McCaughey and Others v. the United Kingdom, no. 43098/09, 16 July 2013