Index 2016 to the Information Notes on the Court’s case-law
The Information Note, compiled by the Court’s Case-Law Information and Publications Division, contains summaries of cases examined during the month in question which the Registry considers as being of particular interest. The summaries are not binding on the Court. In the provisional version the summaries are normally drafted in the language of the case concerned, whereas the final single-language version appears in English and French respectively.

An annual index provides an overview of all the cases summarised in each calendar year. To facilitate access to materials in the Information Notes, a running cumulative index will be updated online with each new edition of the provisional version of the Note. The important cases summarised in the Information Notes are indexed by Convention Article, keyword, applicant name and respondent State. The Index also contains a list of cases which have been referred to or relinquished in favour of the Grand Chamber.

The Information Note and the index may be downloaded at <www.echr.coe.int/NoteInformation/en>. Legal summaries published in the Case-law Information Notes are also available in HUDOC under Legal Summaries.

The HUDOC database is available free-of-charge through the Court’s Internet site (<http://hudoc.echr.coe.int/eng>). It provides access to the case-law of the European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber, Chamber and Committee judgments, decisions, communicated cases, advisory opinions and legal summaries from the Case-Law Information Note), the European Commission of Human Rights (decisions and reports) and the Committee of Ministers (resolutions).
TABLE OF CONTENTS

CASES LISTED BY CONVENTION ARTICLE AND KEYWORD ........................................... 9

ARTICLE 1 ............................................................................................................................... 9
  Jurisdiction of States ......................................................................................................... 9

ARTICLE 2 ............................................................................................................................... 9
  Life .................................................................................................................................... 9
  Use of force ....................................................................................................................... 9
  Positive obligations (substantive aspect) .......................................................................... 9
  Effective investigation .................................................................................................... 10
  Positive obligations (procedural aspect) ......................................................................... 11
  Expulsion ........................................................................................................................ 11

ARTICLE 3 ............................................................................................................................. 12
  Torture ............................................................................................................................ 12
  Inhuman or degrading treatment ..................................................................................... 12
  Degrading treatment ....................................................................................................... 12
  Inhuman or degrading punishment .................................................................................. 13
  Positive obligations (substantive aspect) ........................................................................ 13
  Effective investigation .................................................................................................... 13
  Expulsion ........................................................................................................................ 14
  Extradition ...................................................................................................................... 14

ARTICLE 4 ............................................................................................................................. 14
  Article 4 § 1 ............................................................................................................................. 14
    Positive obligations – Trafficking in human beings ....................................................... 14
  Article 4 § 2 ............................................................................................................................. 15
    Forced labour – Compulsory labour ............................................................................... 15
  Article 4 § 3 (a) ....................................................................................................................... 15
    Work required of detainees .......................................................................................... 15
ARTICLE 5.............................................................................................................................................. 15

Article 5 § 1 ............................................................................................................................................. 15
  Liberty of person................................................................................................................................. 15
  Deprivation of liberty...................................................................................................................... 15
  Lawful arrest or detention.............................................................................................................. 15

Article 5 § 1 (d) ........................................................................................................................................ 16
  Minors............................................................................................................................................... 16
  Educational supervision.................................................................................................................. 16

Article 5 § 1 (e) ........................................................................................................................................ 16
  Persons of unsound mind............................................................................................................... 16

Article 5 § 1 (f) ........................................................................................................................................ 16
  Expulsion......................................................................................................................................... 16

Article 5 § 3 ............................................................................................................................................. 16
  Brought promptly before judge or other officer .......................................................................... 16
  Reasonableness of pre-trial detention............................................................................................ 17

Article 5 § 4 ............................................................................................................................................. 17
  Take proceedings............................................................................................................................. 17
  Review of lawfulness of detention............................................................................................... 17

ARTICLE 6................................................................................................................................................. 17

Article 6 § 1 (civil) .................................................................................................................................. 17
  Civil rights and obligations............................................................................................................ 17
  Access to court............................................................................................................................... 17
  Fair hearing..................................................................................................................................... 18
  Equality of arms............................................................................................................................. 19
  Oral hearing.................................................................................................................................... 19
  Independent and impartial tribunal............................................................................................... 19
  Impartial tribunal............................................................................................................................ 19

Article 6 § 1 (criminal) .......................................................................................................................... 20
  Criminal charge............................................................................................................................... 20
  Access to court............................................................................................................................... 20
  Fair hearing..................................................................................................................................... 20
Independent and impartial tribunal .......................................................................................... 21
Impartial tribunal .................................................................................................................. 21

**Article 6 § 1 (administrative) ................................................................. 21**
- Access to court ................................................................................................. 21
- Adversarial trial – Equality of arms .......................................................... 21
- Public hearing .................................................................................................. 21
- Independent and impartial tribunal .......................................................... 21
- Impartial tribunal .......................................................................................... 21

**Article 6 § 1 (constitutional) ................................................................. 21**
- Fair hearing .................................................................................................. 21

**Article 6 § 2 ........................................................................................................ 22**
- Presumption of innocence ........................................................................ 22

**Article 6 § 3 ........................................................................................................ 22**
- Rights of defence ......................................................................................... 22

**Article 6 § 3 (c) .................................................................................................. 22**
- Defence through legal assistance .............................................................. 22

**Article 6 § 3 (d) .................................................................................................. 22**
- Examination of witnesses .......................................................................... 22

**ARTICLE 7 ........................................................................................................ 23**
- *Nullum crimen sine lege* ........................................................................... 23
- *Nulla poena sine lege* ................................................................................ 23
- Heavier penalty .............................................................................................. 23
- Retroactivity .................................................................................................... 23

**ARTICLE 8 ........................................................................................................ 23**
- Respect for private and family life .............................................................. 23
- Respect for private life .................................................................................. 24
- Respect for family life .................................................................................. 25
- Respect for home ........................................................................................... 26
- Respect for correspondence ....................................................................... 26
- Positive obligations ....................................................................................... 26
- Expulsion ........................................................................................................ 27
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ARTICLE</th>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Freedom of thought</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Freedom of conscience</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Freedom of religion</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Manifest religion or belief</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Freedom of expression</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Freedom to impart information</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Freedom to receive information</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Freedom of peaceful assembly</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Freedom of association</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Right to marry</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Effective remedy</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Discrimination (Article 2)</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discrimination (Article 3)</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discrimination (Article 8)</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discrimination (Article 9)</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discrimination (Article 1 of Protocol No. 1)</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discrimination (Article 2 of Protocol No. 1)</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discrimination (Article 3 of Protocol No. 1)</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Restriction for unauthorised purposes</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Limitation on use of restrictions on rights</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Inter-State application</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Index 2016 to the Information Notes on the Court’s case-law

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Article</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ARTICLE 34</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locus standi</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victim</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARTICLE 35</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 35 § 1</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exhaustion of domestic remedies</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effective domestic remedy – Republic of Moldova</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effective domestic remedy – Russia</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Six-month period</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 35 § 3 (a)</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manifestly ill-founded</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 35 § 3 (b)</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No significant disadvantage</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARTICLE 37</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Striking out applications</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special circumstances requiring further examination</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARTICLE 41</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Just satisfaction</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARTICLE 46</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pilot judgment – General measures</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Execution of judgment</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Execution of judgment – General measures</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possessions</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peaceful enjoyment of possessions</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deprivation of property</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control of the use of property</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 1</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Free expression of the opinion of the people</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stand for election</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 4 ................................................................. 40

Article 2 § 1 ............................................................................................. 40

Freedom to choose residence ................................................................. 40

ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL No. 4 ............................................................. 40

Prohibition of collective expulsion of aliens ............................................ 40

ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL No. 7 ............................................................... 40

Right not to be tried or punished twice .................................................... 40

ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 12 .............................................................. 40

General prohibition of discrimination ..................................................... 40

CASES ACCEPTED FOR REFERAL TO THE GRAND CHAMBER
AND CASES IN WHICH JURISDICTION WAS RELINQUISHED
BY A CHAMBER IN FAVOUR OF THE GRAND CHAMBER ......................... 41

CASES LISTED ALPHABETICALLY BY RESPONDENT STATE............... 44

Andora ........................................................................................................ 44
Armenia ...................................................................................................... 44
Austria ........................................................................................................ 44
Azerbaijan .................................................................................................. 44
Belgium ...................................................................................................... 44
Bosnia and Herzegovina ........................................................................... 44
Bulgaria ..................................................................................................... 45
Croatia ....................................................................................................... 45
Cyprus ....................................................................................................... 45
Czech Republic .......................................................................................... 45
Denmark .................................................................................................... 46
Estonia ....................................................................................................... 46
Finland ....................................................................................................... 46
France ........................................................................................................ 46
Georgia ..................................................................................................... 46
Germany .................................................................................................... 47
Greece ....................................................................................................... 47
Hungary ..................................................................................................... 47
Italy ............................................................................................................ 48
Latvia ........................................................................................................ 48
Lithuania ......................................................................................................................... 48
Malta ............................................................................................................................... 49
Moldova (Republic of) .................................................................................................... 49
Netherlands ..................................................................................................................... 49
Norway ............................................................................................................................ 49
Poland ............................................................................................................................. 49
Portugal ........................................................................................................................... 49
Romania .......................................................................................................................... 50
Russia .............................................................................................................................. 50
Serbia .............................................................................................................................. 51
Slovenia .......................................................................................................................... 51
Spain ............................................................................................................................... 51
Sweden ............................................................................................................................ 51
Switzerland ..................................................................................................................... 52
The former yugoslav Republic of Macedonia ............................................................. 52
Turkey ............................................................................................................................. 52
Ukraine ............................................................................................................................ 53
United Kingdom ............................................................................................................ 54

CASES LISTED ALPHABETICALLY BY APPLICANT .................................................. 55

DECISIONS OF OTHER INTERNATIONAL JURISDICTIONS ................................. 63

Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU) .......................................................... 63
Inter-American Court of Human Rights (IACtHR) ....................................................... 64
CASES LISTED BY CONVENTION ARTICLE AND KEYWORD

ARTICLE 1

Jurisdiction of States

Jurisdiction of Moldovan and Russian Governments in relation to person detained within separatist region of the Republic of Moldova

Mozer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC], 11138/10, 23 February 2016 ..............no. 193

Jurisdiction of Sweden in respect of defamation proceedings brought in respect of a television programme broadcast from a foreign country

Arlewin v. Sweden, 22302/10, 1 March 2016 .................................................................no. 194

ARTICLE 2

Life

Presidential pardon and release of convicted murderer following his transfer to Azerbaijan to serve remainder of sentence imposed in Hungary: communicated

Makuchyan and Minasyan v. Azerbaijan and Hungary, 17247/13......................................no. 193

Use of force

Unlawful killing of applicant’s son by police during demonstration and ineffective investigation: case referred to the Grand Chamber

Nagmetov v. Russia, 35589/08 (Chamber judgment of 5 November 2015) .....................no. 194

Killing of applicants’ relatives by military forces and ineffectiveness of ensuing investigation: violations

Cangöz and Others v. Turkey, 7469/06, 26 April 2016....................................................no. 195

Positive obligations (substantive aspect)

Patient allegedly deprived of access to appropriate emergency care as a result of a lack of coordination between departments of a public hospital: case referred to the Grand Chamber

Lopes de Sousa Fernandes v. Portugal, 56080/13 (Chamber judgment of 15 December 2015) ..............................................................no. 196

-ooo-
Absence of State responsibility for injuries caused to holidaymaker in boating accident: Article 2 applicable; no violation
  Cavit Tinartlıoğlu v. Turkey, 3648/04, 2 February 2016 ...................................................... no. 193

Lack of adequate medical care for HIV-positive detainee who died in detention and lack of effective investigation into his death: violations
  Karpylenko v. Ukraine, 15509/12, 11 February 2016 ........................................................... no. 193

Authorities’ failure to protect life of domestic-violence victim: violation
  Civek v. Turkey, 55354/11, 23 February 2016 ....................................................................... no. 193

Insufficient consideration given to risk of fatal injuries in context of domestic violence: violation
  Halime Kılıç v. Turkey, 63034/11, 28 June 2016 ..................................................................... no. 198

Death of newborn baby denied access to adequate emergency care in a public hospital as a result of negligence and structural failings: violation
  Aydoğdu v. Turkey, 40448/06, 30 August 2016 ....................................................................... no. 199

Failure by domestic authorities to inspect construction site where child subsequently died and inadequacy of judicial authorities: violation
  Cevrioğlu v. Turkey, 69546/12, 4 October 2016 .................................................................... no. 200

Alleged failure by police to prevent mass shooting by withdrawing firearms licence: communicated
  Kotilainen and Others v. Finland, 62439/12 ............................................................................. no. 192

Authorities’ failure to close airspace above military conflict zone resulting in incident with the Malaysian Airlines MH17 flight: communicated
  Ioppa v. Ukraine, 73776/14 ...................................................................................................... no. 198

Alleged refusal of security forces to allow evacuation of wounded before shelling basement in which they had sought refuge: communicated
  Yavuzel and Others v. Turkey (dec.), 5317/16 et al., 6 December 2016 ............................... no. 202

Effective investigation

Alleged failure to conduct effective investigation into fatal shooting of person mistakenly identified as suspected terrorist: no violation
  Armani Da Silva v. the United Kingdom [GC], 5878/08, 30 March 2016 ................................. no. 194

Unlawful killing of applicant’s son by police during demonstration and ineffective investigation: case referred to the Grand Chamber
  Nagmetov v. Russia, 35589/08 (Chamber judgment of 5 November 2015) ............................ no. 194

Lack of adequate medical care for HIV-positive detainee who died in detention and lack of effective investigation into his death: violations
  Karpylenko v. Ukraine, 15509/12, 11 February 2016 .............................................................. no. 193

Killing of applicants’ relatives by military forces and ineffectiveness of ensuing investigation: violations
  Cangöz and Others v. Turkey, 7469/06, 26 April 2016 .............................................................. no. 195
Ineffective and lengthy investigation into applicant’s son’s death: violation
   Mučibabić v. Serbia, 34661/07, 12 July 2016...............................................................no. 198

Inadequacy of expert medical reports into death of newborn baby in public hospital: violation
   Aydoğan v. Turkey, 40448/06, 30 August 2016............................................................no. 199

Independence and adequacy of investigation into military aircraft crash in which numerous spectators were killed at public air show: no violation
   Mikhno v. Ukraine, 32514/12, 1 September 2016..........................................................no. 199

-ooo-

Alleged refusal of security forces to allow evacuation of wounded before shelling basement in which they had sought refuge: communicated
   Yavuzel and Others v. Turkey (dec.), 5317/16 et al., 6 December 2016..........................no. 202

Positive obligations (procedural aspect)

Patient allegedly deprived of access to appropriate emergency care as a result of a lack of coordination between departments of a public hospital: case referred to the Grand Chamber
   Lopes de Sousa Fernandes v. Portugal, 56080/13 (Chamber judgment of 15 December 2015).................................................................no. 196

-ooo-

Absence of State responsibility for injuries caused to holidaymaker in boating accident:
   Article 2 applicable; no violation
   Cavit Tinarlıoğlu v. Turkey, 3648/04, 2 February 2016..............................................no. 193

Excessive formalism in application of rule that accused cannot be convicted in absence without first being questioned: violation
   Öztünç v. Turkey, 14777/08, 9 February 2016 ...............................................................no. 193

Failure by domestic authorities to inspect construction site where child subsequently died and inadequacy of judicial authorities: violation
   Cevrióglu v. Turkey, 69546/12, 4 October 2016............................................................no. 200

Delayed enforcement of sentence imposed on accused found guilty of serious assault on the applicant: violation
   Kitanovska Stanojkovic and Others v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia,
   2319/14, 13 October 2016.......................................................................................no. 200

-ooo-

Presidential pardon and release of convicted murderer following his transfer to Azerbaijan to serve remainder of sentence imposed in Hungary: communicated
   Makuchyan and Minasyan v. Azerbaijan and Hungary, 17247/13...............................no. 193

Expulsion

Proposed expulsion to Iran of low-profile political activist: deportation would not constitute a violation
Proposed expulsion to Iran without adequate investigation of reality and implications of conversion to Christianity after arrival in Europe: deportation would constitute a violation
   F.G. v. Sweden [GC], 43611/11, 23 March 2016........................................................no. 194
ARTICLE 3

Torture

Torture and inhuman and degrading treatment resulting from applicant’s extraordinary rendition under CIA programme: violations

Nasr and Ghali v. Italy, 44883/09, 23 February 2016...............................................................no. 193

Inhuman or degrading treatment

Conditions of detention and lack of medical assistance in separatist region of the Republic of Moldova: no violation; violation

Mozer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC], 11138/10, 23 February 2016..............no. 193

Failure to provide adequate medical care for minor during detention to “correct his behaviour”: violation

Blokhin v. Russia [GC], 47152/06, 23 March 2016...............................................................no. 194

Acute mental suffering and anxiety caused by extraordinary rendition of applicant’s husband under CIA programme: violation

Nasr and Ghali v. Italy, 44883/09, 23 February 2016...............................................................no. 193

Failure to perform Helicobacter pylori test and other shortcomings in treatment of detainee’s ulcer: violation

Kolesnikovich v. Russia, 44694/13, 22 March 2016...............................................................no. 194

Shackling of pregnant woman before and after delivery; poor conditions of detention of mother and newborn; insufficient medical care to newborn in detention facility; placement of pregnant woman in metal cage during court hearings: violations

Korneykova and Korneykov v. Ukraine, 56660/12, 24 March 2016........................................no. 194

Conditions of detention and of transfer of paraplegic remand prisoner: violations

Topekhin v. Russia, 78774/13, 10 May 2016..........................................................................no. 196

Excessive use of force to disperse demonstration and lack of effective investigation: violation

Süleyman Celebi and Others v. Turkey, 37273/10 et al., 24 May 2016...........................................no. 196

Administrative detention of minors pending expulsion: violations

A.B. and Others v. France, 11593/12, 12 July 2016
R.K. and Others v. France, 68264/14, 12 July 2016
R.C. and V.C. v. France, 76491/14, 12 July 2016
R.M. and Others v. France, 33201/11, 12 July 2016
A.M. and Others v. France, 24587/12, 12 July 2016...............................................................no. 198

Allegations of unlawful detention and ill-treatment by authorities of so-called Lugansk and Donetsk People’s Republics: communicated

L.M.P. and V.V.P. v. Ukraine and Russia, 45742/15
O.I.Z. and V.P.Z. v. Ukraine and Russia, 22980/16.................................................................no. 198

Degradation of treatment

Limited personal space in multi-occupancy prison accommodation: violation; no violations

Muršić v. Croatia [GC], 7334/13, 20 October 2016.................................................................no. 200
Unsubstantiated allegations that prisoner had contracted Hepatitis C in prison and not received proper medical care: no violation

_Cătălin Eugen Micu v. Romania, 55104/13, 5 January 2016_.............................................................no. 192

Ill-treatment of lawyer representing client at police station: violation

_Caza v. Romania, 30050/12, 5 April 2016_..........................................................................................no. 195

Bodies of applicants’ relatives displayed at military base for the purpose of examination by prosecutor and doctors: no violation

_Cangöz and Others v. Turkey, 7469/06, 26 April 2016_....................................................................no. 195

Structural problem resulting in detention for more than nine years in psychiatric wing of prison with no prospect of change or appropriate medical help: violation

_W.D v. Belgium, 73548/13, 6 September 2016_..................................................................................no. 199

Confinement of defendant in glass cabin during criminal trial: violation; no violation

_Yaroslav Belousov v. Russia, 2653/13 and 60980/14, 4 October 2016_.............................................no. 200

Failure to ensure twelve-year old child was looked after by an adult while his police were held in police custody: violation

_ Ioan Pop and Others v. Romania, 52924/09, 6 December 2016_......................................................no. 202

**Inhuman or degrading punishment**

_De facto_ irreducibility of life sentence imposed on prisoner suffering from mental illness: violation

_Murray v. the Netherlands [GC], 10511/10, 26 April 2016_.................................................................no. 195

_Life imprisonment with automatic review after 40 years: violation

_T.P. and A.T v. Hungary, 37871/14 and 73986/14, 4 October 2016_.....................................................no. 200

**Positive obligations (substantive aspect)**

Unsubstantiated allegations that prisoner had contracted Hepatitis C in prison and not received proper medical care: no violation

_Cătălin Eugen Micu v. Romania, 55104/13, 5 January 2016_.............................................................no. 192

Lack of access to protection measures against domestic violence for divorced or unmarried women: violation

_M.G. v. Turkey, 646/10, 22 March 2016_...............................................................................................no. 194

Obligation on prison authorities to seek independent medical advice on the appropriate treatment for a drug-addicted prisoner: violation

_Wenner v. Germany, 62303/13, 1 September 2016_.................................................................................no. 199

Failure to ensure twelve-year old child was looked after by an adult while his police were held in police custody: violation

_Ioan Pop and Others v. Romania, 52924/09, 6 December 2016_......................................................no. 202

**Effective investigation**

Refusal to reopen criminal proceedings in respect of which Government had submitted unilateral declaration: violation

_Jeronovičs v. Latvia [GC], 44898/10, 5 July 2016_..................................................................................no. 198

-ooo-
Torture and inhuman and degrading treatment resulting from applicant’s extraordinary rendition under CIA programme: violations

Nasr and Ghali v. Italy, 44883/09, 23 February 2016.......................................................... no. 193

Authorities’ failure to take into account local background of racist violence when investigating assault on migrant: violation

Sakir v. Greece, 48475/09, 24 March 2016 ........................................................................ no. 194

Excessive use of force to disperse demonstration and lack of effective investigation: violation

Süleyman Çelebi and Others v. Turkey, 37273/10 et al., 24 May 2016............................... no. 196

Expulsion

Proposed expulsion to Iran of low-profile political activist: deportation would not constitute a violation

Proposed expulsion to Iran without adequate investigation of reality and implications of conversion to Christianity after arrival in Europe: deportation would constitute a violation

F.G. v. Sweden [GC], 43611/11, 23 March 2016................................................................. no. 194

Proposed deportation to Iraq of family threatened by al-Qaeda: deportation would constitute a violation

J.K. and Others v. Sweden [GC], 59166/12, 23 August 2016............................................. no. 199

Proposed deportation of person suffering from serious illness to his country of origin in face of doubts as to the availability of appropriate medical treatment there: expulsion would have constituted a violation

Paposhvili v. Belgium [GC], 41738/10, 13 December 2016 .............................................. no. 202

Extradition

Proposed extradition to United States where applicant faced life imprisonment without parole: relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber

Harkins v. the United Kingdom, 71537/14............................................................................. no. 198

Torture and inhuman and degrading treatment resulting from applicant’s extraordinary rendition under CIA programme: violations

Nasr and Ghali v. Italy, 44883/09, 23 February 2016.......................................................... no. 193

Extradition to the United Stated where applicant faced charges amounting to a maximum prison sentence of 247.5 years: inadmissible

Findikoglu v. Germany (dec.), 20672/15, 7 June 2016......................................................... no. 197

ARTICLE 4

Article 4 § 1

Positive obligations – Trafficking in human beings

Shortcomings in response to criminal complaint of human-trafficking: violation

L.E. v. Greece, 71545/12, 21 January 2016........................................................................ no. 192
Article 4 § 2

Forced labour – Compulsory labour

Conditions of employment of personal assistant caring for severely disabled relative: inadmissible

Radi and Gherghina v. Romania (dec.), 34655/14, 5 January 2016 .............................................no. 192

Article 4 § 3 (a)

Work required of detainees

Continuing obligation on prisoner to work after reaching retirement age: no violation

Meier v. Switzerland, 10109/14, 9 February 2016 .................................................................no. 193

ARTICLE 5

Article 5 § 1

Liberty of person

Allegations of unlawful detention and ill-treatment by authorities of so-called Lugansk and Donetsk People’s Republics: communicated

L.M.P. and V.V.P. v. Ukraine and Russia, 45742/15
O.I.Z. and V.P.Z. v. Ukraine and Russia, 22980/16..............................................................no. 198

Deprivation of liberty

Lawyer held in office in police station for less than ten minutes: no violation

Cazan v. Romania, 30050/12, 5 April 2016...........................................................................no. 195

Five hours’ detention by airport police purportedly investigating claims of ticket forgeries: violation

Kasparov v. Russia, 53659/07, 11 October 2016.....................................................................no. 200

Lawful arrest or detention

Detention ordered by “courts” of separatist region of the Republic of Moldova: no violation; violation

Mozer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC], 11138/10, 23 February 2016...........no. 193

Protracted detention pending deportation of alien who refused to take necessary steps to obtain travel documents required for his return: violation

J.N. v. the United Kingdom, 37289/12, 19 May 2016.............................................................no. 196


**Article 5 § 1 (d)**

**Minors**

Placement of minor in closed boarding school owing to antisocial behaviour and risk she would engage in prostitution:  *no violation*

_D.L. v. Bulgaria, 7472/14, 19 May 2016_ ........................................................................................................... no. 196

**Educational supervision**

Thirty-day placement of minor in detention centre for young offenders to “correct his behaviour”:  *violation*

_Blokhin v. Russia [GC], 47152/06, 23 March 2016_ ........................................................................................................... no. 194

**Article 5 § 1 (e)**

**Persons of unsound mind**

Preventive detention of mental-health patient in purpose-built centre offering appropriate medical care:  *no violation*

_Bergmann v. Germany, 23279/14, 7 January 2016_ .................................................................................................... no. 192

Preventive detention of violent mental-health patient in purpose-built centre offering appropriate medical care:  *no violation*

_Petschulies v. Germany, 6281/13, 2 June 2016_ .................................................................................................... no. 197

**Article 5 § 1 (f)**

**Expulsion**

Protracted detention pending deportation of alien who refused to take necessary steps to obtain travel documents required for his return:  *violation*

_J.N. v. the United Kingdom, 37289/12, 19 May 2016_ ........................................................................................................... no. 196

Authorities required to examine alternative measures to administrative detention of families pending expulsion:  *violations; no violations*

_A.B. and Others v. France, 11593/12, 12 July 2016_  
_R.K. and Others v. France, 68264/14, 12 July 2016_  
_R.C. and V.C. v. France, 76491/14, 12 July 2016_  
_R.M. and Others v. France, 33201/11, 12 July 2016_  
_A.M. and Others v. France, 24587/12, 12 July 2016_ ........................................................................................................... no. 198

**Article 5 § 3**

**Brought promptly before judge or other officer**

Lack of independence of military court owing to judges’ appraisal system and presence of active officer on the bench:  *violation*

_Kerman v. Turkey, 35132/05, 22 November 2016_ ........................................................................................................... no. 201
Reasonableness of pre-trial detention

Absence of relevant and sufficient reasons for pre-trial detention other than reasonable suspicion of commission of an offence: violation

Buzadji v. the Republic of Moldova [GC], 23755/07, 5 July 2016 ................................................................. no. 198

Article 5 § 4

Take proceedings

Lack of direct access to periodical judicial review of placement of endangered minor in closed boarding school: violation

D.L. v. Bulgaria, 7472/14, 19 May 2016 ............................................................................................................ no. 196

Review of lawfulness of detention

Lack of direct access to periodical judicial review of placement of endangered minor in closed boarding school: violation

D.L. v. Bulgaria, 7472/14, 19 May 2016 ............................................................................................................ no. 196

Unduly limited scope of review of administrative court ruling on an appeal against administrative detention order: violation

A.M. v. France, 56324/13, 12 July 2016 ............................................................................................................ no. 198

ARTICLE 6

Article 6 § 1 (civil)

Civil rights and obligations

Sanctions imposed on applicants on basis of UN Security Council resolution without judicial scrutiny: violation

Al-Dulimi and Montana Management Inc. v. Switzerland [GC], 5809/08, 21 June 2016 ...................................................... no. 197

Inability of Supreme Court President to contest premature termination of his mandate: Article 6 applicable

Baka v. Hungary [GC], 20261/12, 23 June 2016 ............................................................................................ no. 197

-Unoo-

Unfairness of lustration proceedings against Constitutional Court president owing to remarks made by Prime Minister while proceedings were pending: violation

Ivanovski v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 29908/11, 21 January 2016..... no. 192

Access to court

Sanctions imposed on applicants on basis of UN Security Council resolution without judicial scrutiny: violation

Al-Dulimi and Montana Management Inc. v. Switzerland [GC], 5809/08, 21 June 2016 ...................................................... no. 197
Inability of Supreme Court President to contest premature termination of his mandate: violation

*Baka v. Hungary [GC], 20261/12, 23 June 2016* ................................................................. no. 197

Decision regarding restitution of places of worship based on “wishes of the adherents of the communities which owned the properties”: no violation

*Greek-Catholic Parish of Lupeni and Others v. Romania [GC], 76943/11, 29 November 2016* ............................................................................................................................... no. 201

-ooo-

Supreme Court ruling that civil courts had no jurisdiction to hear pastor’s claim for wrongful dismissal by church: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Károly Nagy v. Hungary, 56665/09 (Chamber judgment of 1 December 2015)* .............. no. 196

Absence of universal jurisdiction of civil courts in torture cases: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Naït-Liman v. Switzerland, 51357/07 (Chamber judgment of 21 June 2016)* ....................... no. 201

-ooo-

Waiver of right to appeal against arbitration award: *inadmissible*

*Tabbane v. Switzerland (dec.), 41069/12, 1 March 2016* .................................................. no. 194

Absence of proper procedural safeguards in proceedings to deprive applicant suffering from mental disorders of his legal capacity: violation

*A.N. v. Lithuania, 17280/08, 31 May 2016* ........................................................................ no. 196

Absence of universal jurisdiction of civil courts in torture cases: *no violation*

*Naït-Liman v. Switzerland, 51357/07, 21 June 2016* ................................................................ no. 197

Inadmissibility of appeal on points of law due to failure to comply with statutory requirement to formulate a “legal question” at the end of a ground of appeal: *no violation*

*Trevisanato v. Italy, 32610/07, 15 September 2016* .......................................................... no. 199

Grant of State immunity from jurisdiction in respect of claim for unfair dismissal by Embassy employee working on cultural and information matters: *inadmissible (Sweden); violation (Lithuania)*

*Naku v. Lithuania and Sweden, 26126/07, 8 November 2016* ........................................ no. 201

Fair hearing

Enforcement in Latvia of judgment delivered in Cyprus in the debtor’s absence: *no violation*

*Avotina v. Latvia [GC], 17502/07, 23 May 2016* ................................................................ no. 196

Profound and lasting divergences in the case-law of a superior court and failure to use mechanism designed to avoid case-law conflict: *violation*

*Greek-Catholic Parish of Lupeni and Others v. Romania [GC], 76943/11, 29 November 2016* ......................................................................................................................... no. 201

-ooo-

Unfairness of lustration proceedings against Constitutional Court president owing to remarks made by Prime Minister while proceedings were pending: *violation*

*Ivanovski v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 29908/11, 21 January 2016* .... no. 192
Detainees’ inability to attend hearings in civil proceedings to which they were parties: violation

*Yevdokimov and Others v. Russia, 27236/05 et al., 16 February 2016* ........................................ no. 193

Application of supervisory review procedure in applicants’ civil cases following 2008 reform in conformity with legal certainty requirement: no violation

*Trapeznikov and Others v. Russia, 5623/09 et al., 5 April 2016* ........................................... no. 195

Absence of proper procedural safeguards in proceedings to deprive applicant suffering from mental disorders of his legal capacity: violation

*A.N. v. Lithuania, 17280/08, 31 May 2016* ........................................................................... no. 196

Failure by appellate courts to verify whether absent parties had received notification of hearing: violation

*Gankin and Others v. Russia, 2430/06 et al., 31 May 2016* ................................................... no. 196

Failure of domestic authorities to thoroughly assess evidence in civil proceedings: violation

*Saliba v. Malta, 24221/13, 29 November 2016* ....................................................................... no. 201

**Equality of arms**

Enforcement in Latvia of judgment delivered in Cyprus in the debtor’s absence: no violation

*Avotiņš v. Latvia [GC], 17502/07, 23 May 2016* ................................................................. no. 196

**Oral hearing**

Lack of substantive reasons for small-claims court’s refusal to hold oral hearing: violation

*Pönkä v. Estonia, 64160/11, 8 November 2016* ............................................................... no. 201

**Independent and impartial tribunal**

Impartiality and independence of members of State Judicial Council in professional misconduct proceedings against a judge: violation

*Gerovska Popčevska v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 48783/07, 7 January 2016* ................................................................. no. 192

Alleged lack of independence and impartiality of military courts: inadmissible

*Mikhno v. Ukraine, 32514/12, 1 September 2016* ............................................................... no. 199

**Impartial tribunal**

Impartiality of State Judicial Council in professional misconduct proceedings against judges: violation

*Jakšovski and Trifunovski v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 56381/09 and 58738/09, 7 January 2016* ................................................................. no. 192

Indication by judge that litigant’s refusal to accept friendly settlement in domestic proceedings might adversely affect the outcome: violation

*Vardanyan and Nanushyan v. Armenia, 8001/07, 27 October 2016* ...................................... no. 200
Article 6 § 1 (criminal)

Criminal charge

Proceedings leading to minor’s placement in detention centre for young offenders to “correct his behaviour”: Article 6 applicable

Blokhin v. Russia [GC], 47152/06, 23 March 2016..........................no. 194

Bus driver found guilty of causing road accident in proceedings in which he was not involved: Article 6 applicable

Igor Pascari v. the Republic of Moldova, 25555/10, 30 August 2016..................no. 199

Access to court

Rejection by Supreme Court of request for revision of criminal judgment following judgment of European Court finding violation of Article 6 of the Convention: relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber

Moreira Ferreira v. Portugal (no 2.), 19867/12..................................................no. 192

Swedish courts refusal to exercise jurisdiction in respect of defamation proceedings concerning a television broadcast from a foreign country: violation

Arlewin v. Sweden, 22302/10, 1 March 2016..................................................no. 194

Unduly formalistic refusal to reinstate appeal proceedings lodged with wrong court by psychiatric patient: violation

Marc Brauer v. Germany, 24062/13, 1 September 2016...............................no. 199

Fair hearing

Adequate procedural safeguards in place to enable accused to understand reasons for jury’s guilty verdict in assize court: no violation

Lhermitte v. Belgium [GC], 34238/09, 29 November 2016...............................no. 201

Manifestly unreasonable conviction of political activist and his alleged accomplice: violation

Navalnyy and Ofitserov v. Russia, 46632/13 and 28671/14, 23 February 2016...............no. 193

Court of Appeal’s decision to overturn acquittal on the basis of its own assessment of the record of evidence that had been before the trial court: no violation

Kashlev v. Estonia, 22574/08, 26 April 2016...................................................no. 195

Decision of court of appeal to overturn applicant’s acquittal without hearing oral testimony from main prosecution witnesses: violation

Lazu v. the Republic of Moldova, 46182/08, 5 July 2016.................................no. 198

Bus driver found guilty of causing road accident in proceedings in which he was not involved: violation

Igor Pascari v. the Republic of Moldova, 25555/10, 30 August 2016..................no. 199

Impact of confinement in glass cabin on the exercise of an accused’s right to participate effectively in proceedings: violation

Yaroslav Belousov v. Russia, 2653/13 and 60980/14, 4 October 2016..................no. 200
Independent and impartial tribunal

Alleged influence of parliamentary commission of inquiry and media coverage on a criminal trial: no violation

_Rywin v. Poland, 6091/06, 4047/07 and 4070/07, 18 February 2016_ .................................................. no. 193

Impartial tribunal

Criminal trial conducted by a court where victim’s mother worked as a judge: violation

_Mitrov v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 45959/09, 2 June 2016_ ..................... no. 197

Article 6 § 1 (administrative)

Access to court

Appeal dismissed by Supreme Administrative Court for lack of clear and detailed evidence that statutory conditions of admissibility were met: no violation

_Papaioannou v. Greece, 18880/15, 2 June 2016_ ........................................................................ no. 197

Adversarial trial – Equality of arms

Lack of access to classified information constituting decisive evidence in judicial-review proceedings: case referred to the Grand Chamber

_Regner v. the Czech Republic, 35289/11 (Chamber judgment of 26 November 2015)_ ........ no. 196

Public hearing

Limited scope of review by Supreme Court of Judicial Services Commission’s decisions in disciplinary proceedings: case referred to the Grand Chamber

_Ramos Nunes de Carvalho e Sá v. Portugal, 55391/13, 57728/13 and 74041/13_  
(Chamber judgment of 21 June 2016) .......................................................................................... no. 200

Independent and impartial tribunal

Limited scope of review by Supreme Court of Judicial Services Commission’s decisions in disciplinary proceedings: case referred to the Grand Chamber

_Ramos Nunes de Carvalho e Sá v. Portugal, 55391/13, 57728/13 and 74041/13_  
(Chamber judgment of 21 June 2016) .......................................................................................... no. 200

Impartial tribunal

Lack of a prosecuting party in administrative offence proceedings: violation

_Karelin v. Russia, 926/08, 20 September 2016_ ................................................................. no. 199

Lack of impartiality, owing to statements made in earlier public report, of Court of Audit to determine balance of accounts in case concerning the _de facto_ management of public funds: violation

_Beausoleil v. France, 63979/11, 6 October 2016_ ............................................................. no. 200

Article 6 § 1 (constitutional)

Fair hearing

Conflicting Constitutional judgments concerning the Court’s _Salduz_ case-law: no violation

_Borg v. Malta, 37537/13, 12 January 2016_ ............................................................. no. 192
Article 6 § 2

Presumption of innocence

Alleged influence of parliamentary commission of inquiry and media coverage on a criminal trial: no violation

Rywin v. Poland, 6091/06, 4047/07 and 4070/07, 18 February 2016 ...................................................... no. 193

Article 6 § 3

Rights of defence

Lack of adequate procedural guarantees in proceedings leading to minor’s placement in detention centre for young offenders to “correct his behaviour”: violation

Blokhin v. Russia [GC], 47152/06, 23 March 2016 ................................................................................ no. 194

Article 6 § 3 (c)

Defence through legal assistance

Delayed access to a lawyer during police questioning owing to exceptionally serious and imminent threat to public safety: violation; no violation

Ibrahim and Others v. the United Kingdom [GC], 50541/08 et al., 13 September 2016 .... no. 199

Lack of access to a lawyer during first three days of detention: case referred to the Grand Chamber

Simeonovi v. Bulgaria, 21980/04 (Chamber judgment of 20 October 2015) ......................... no. 194

Lawyer not permitted to conduct his own defence in criminal proceedings: relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber

Correia de Matos v. Portugal, 56402/12 ......................................................................................... no. 199

Domestic law not providing for legal assistance during pre-trial investigations: violation

Borg v. Malta, 37537/13, 12 January 2016 ....................................................................................... no. 192

Article 6 § 3 (d)

Examination of witnesses

Conviction on basis of statement of overseas witness who could not be cross-examined: violation

Paić v. Croatia, 47082/12, 29 March 2016 ......................................................................................... no. 194

Admission and use of the incriminating conclusions of an absent expert: no violation

Constantinides v. Greece, 76438/12, 6 October 2016 ................................................................. no. 200
ARTICLE 7

Nullum crimen sine lege

Juror’s committal for contempt of court for disobeying judge’s instructions to jury not to conduct Internet research into case they were trying: no violation

Dallas v. the United Kingdom, 38395/12, 11 February 2016.......................................................no. 193

Nulla poena sine lege

Inconsistent interpretation by the domestic courts of ambiguous provision of domestic law: violation

Žaja v. Croatia, 37462/09, 4 October 2016..................................................................................................no. 200

Heavier penalty

Retrospective extension of preventive detention intended to secure medical and therapeutic treatment: no violation

Bergmann v. Germany, 23279/14, 7 January 2016...............................................................no. 192

Refusal to apply more lenient sentence existing during short interval in legislation between abolition of death penalty and ensuing amendment of the law: no violation

Ruban v. Ukraine, 8927/11, 12 July 2016......................................................................................no. 198

Increased tax liability as a result of loss of special tax status: inadmissible

Société Oxygène Plus v. France (dec.), 76959/11, 17 May 2016......................................................no. 197

Retroactivity

Failure to apply new reduced penalty retrospectively: violation

Gouarré Patte v. Andorra, 33427/10, 12 January 2016.................................................................no. 192

ARTICLE 8

Respect for private and family life

Restrictions on visits by family members and on right to converse in own language in prison in separatist region of the Republic of Moldova: no violation; violation

Mozer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC], 11138/10, 23 February 2016...........no. 193

Legislation preventing health professionals assisting with home births: no violation

Dubská and Krejzová v. the Czech Republic [GC], 28859/11 and 28473/12, 15 November 2016.................................................................no. 201

-ooo-

Change of recognised paternity at request and in favour of biological father without child’s consent: no violation

Mandet v. France, 30955/12, 14 January 2016.................................................................no. 192

De facto discrimination against women arising out of method of calculation of invalidity benefits: Article 8 applicable

Di Trizio v. Switzerland, 7186/09, 2 February 2016.................................................................no. 193
Court order for children’s return to their father against their will: violation
N.Ts. and Others v. Georgia, 71776/12, 2 February 2016 .................................................. no. 193

Religious education teacher’s dismissal following withdrawal of canonical mandate: no violation
Travaš v. Croatia, 75581/13, 4 October 2016 ..................................................................... no. 200

Respect for private life

Monitoring of an employee’s use of the Internet at his place of work and use of data collected to justify his dismissal: case referred to the Grand Chamber
Bărbulescu v. Romania, 61496/08 (Chamber judgment of 12 January 2016) ....................... no. 197

Monitoring of an employee’s use of the Internet at his place of work and use of data collected to justify his dismissal: no violation
Bărbulescu v. Romania, 61496/08, 12 January 2016 .......................................................... no. 192

Absence of sufficient guarantees against abuse in legislation on secret surveillance: violation
Szabó and Vissy v. Hungary, 37138/14, 12 January 2016 ................................................... no. 192

Constitutional Court president’s removal from public office as a result of lustration proceedings: violation
Ivanovski v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 29908/11, 21 January 2016 ....... no. 192

Transfer of deputy prefect to less important post on account of his religious convictions: violation
Sodan v. Turkey, 18650/05, 2 February 2016 ....................................................................... no. 193

No award of damages against publisher for breaching injunction not to publish photographs: no violation
Kahn v. Germany, 16313/10, 17 March 2016 ..................................................................... no. 194

Refusal to prosecute for joke made during television comedy show about homosexual celebrity referred to as a “female”: no violation
Sousa Goucha v. Portugal, 70434/12, 22 March 2016 ........................................................ no. 194

Inadequate investigation into racist abuse directed at woman of Roma origin: violation
R.B. v. Hungary, 64602/12, 12 April 2016 ......................................................................... no. 195

Failure to take into account the kind or degree of applicant’s mental disorder when depriving him of his legal capacity: violation
A.N. v. Lithuania, 17280/08, 31 May 2016 ........................................................................ no. 196

Unjustified lack of ex post facto notification of temporary phone-tapping measure: violation
Cevat Özel v. Turkey, 19602/06, 7 June 2016 .................................................................... no. 197

Use in disciplinary proceedings of data obtained from telephone tapping in criminal proceedings: violation
Karabeyoğlu v. Turkey, 30083/10, 7 June 2016 ................................................................ no. 197

Loss of teaching post as a result of subsequent amendment of certificate recognising overseas diploma: violation
Şahin Kuş v. Turkey, 33160/04, 7 June 2016 ..................................................................... no. 197

Absolute prohibition on growing a beard in prison: violation
Biržietis v. Lithuania, 49304/09, 14 June 2016 ................................................................. no. 197
Use as evidence in disciplinary proceedings against a lawyer of transcript of conversation with client whose telephone was being monitored: no violation

*Versini-Campinchi and Crasnienski v. France, 49176/11, 16 June 2016* .................................................................................................................. no. 197

Withdrawal of citizenship following annulment of simulated marriage: no violation

*Ramadan v. Malta, 76136/12, 21 June 2016* ........................................................................................................................................................................ no. 197

Asylum-seeker living under precarious conditions for years owing to continuing failure of highest appellate authority to decide his appeal: violation

*B.A.C. v. Greece, 11981/15, 13 October 2016* ........................................................................................................................................................................ no. 200

Unlawful surveillance of activities of social-insurance claimant by private investigators: violation

*Vukota-Bojić v. Switzerland, 61838/10, 18 October 2016* ...................................................................................................................................................... no. 200

Inability of man claiming to be biological father to contest paternity of child whose paternity had already been recognised by another man: violation

*L.D. and P.K. v. Bulgaria, 7949/11 and 45522/13, 8 December 2016* .................................................................................................................. no. 202

Dam construction threatening important archaeological site: communicated

*Ahunbay and Others v. Turkey, Austria and Germany (dec.), 6080/06, 21 June 2016* .................................................................................................................. no. 198

Public exposure of holders of public office as collaborators of communist regime on basis of former security-service records: communicated

*Anchev v. Bulgaria, 38334/08* ................................................................................................................................................................................... no. 202

**Respect for family life**

Imposition of immediate custodial sentence on mother for preventing father from seeing their child: no violation

*Mitrova and Savik v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 42534/09, 11 February 2016* ........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................ no. 193

Placement of children for adoption on grounds of mother’s poverty and refusal to undergo sterilisation: violations

*Soares de Melo v. Portugal, 72850/14, 16 February 2016* ........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................ no. 193

Refusal to order child’s return pursuant to Hague Convention in view of abducting mother’s unwillingness to return with child: violation

*K.J. v. Poland, 30813/14, 1 March 2016* ........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................ no. 194

Parental authority of father with mild intellectual disability restricted on insufficiently demonstrated grounds: violation

*Kocherov and Sergeyeva v. Russia, 16899/13, 29 March 2016* ........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................ no. 194

Permanent exclusion order against settled migrant resulting in separation from wife and children: violation

*Kolonja v. Greece, 49441/12, 19 May 2016* ........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................ no. 196

Inadequacy of measures taken by State to secure father’s right of access to his children pursuant to court order: violation

*Fourkiotis v. Greece, 74758/11, 16 June 2016* ........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................ no. 197
Index 2016 to the Information Notes on the Court’s case-law

Respect for home

Absence of sufficient guarantees against abuse in legislation on secret surveillance: violation

*Szabó and Vissy v. Hungary, 37138/14, 12 January 2016*..................................................................................no. 192

Order, without proportionality assessment, for demolition of applicants’ home for breach of building regulations: *demolition would constitute a violation*

*Ivanova and Cherkezov v. Bulgaria, 46577/15, 21 April 2016*.................................................................no. 195

Search warrant issued on strength of evidence allegedly obtained in breach of domestic and international law: *no violation*

*K.S and M.S. v. Germany, 33696/11, 6 October 2016*.............................................................................no. 200

Forced eviction of Roma families and destruction of their homes with no offer of alternative accommodation: *violation*

*Bagdonavicius and Others v. Russia, 19841/06, 11 October 2016*.......................................................no. 200

Lack of appropriate legal framework to protect occupant of flat from harassment by co-owners: *violation*

*Irina Smirnova v. Ukraine, 1870/05, 13 October 2016*...........................................................................no. 200

Respect for correspondence

Monitoring of an employee’s use of the Internet at his place of work and use of data collected to justify his dismissal: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Bărbulescu v. Romania, 61496/08 (Chamber judgment of 12 January 2016)*...............................no. 197

-ooo-

Monitoring of an employee’s use of the Internet at his place of work and use of data collected to justify his dismissal: *no violation*

*Bărbulescu v. Romania, 61496/08, 12 January 2016*..............................................................................no. 192

Absence of sufficient guarantees against abuse in legislation on secret surveillance: *violation*

*Szabó and Vissy v. Hungary, 37138/14, 12 January 2016*............................................................................no. 192

Blanket and indiscriminate surveillance of correspondence and telephone conversations for minors placed in closed boarding school: *violation*

*D.L. v. Bulgaria, 7472/14, 19 May 2016*..................................................................................................no. 196

Unjustified lack of *ex post facto* notification of temporary phone-tapping measure: *violation*

*Cevat Özel v. Turkey, 19602/06, 7 June 2016*......................................................................................no. 197

Use in disciplinary proceedings of data obtained from telephone tapping in criminal proceedings: *violation*

*Karabeyoğlu v. Turkey, 30083/10, 7 June 2016*......................................................................................no. 197

Use as evidence in disciplinary proceedings against a lawyer of transcript of conversation with client whose telephone was being monitored: *no violation*

*Versini-Campinchi and Crasnianski v. France, 49176/11, 16 June 2016*..............................................no. 197

Positive obligations

Monitoring of an employee’s use of the Internet at his place of work and use of data collected to justify his dismissal: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

*Bărbulescu v. Romania, 61496/08 (Chamber judgment of 12 January 2016)*...............................no. 197

-ooo-
Monitoring of an employee’s use of the Internet at his place of work and use of data collected to justify his dismissal: no violation
  Bărbulescu v. Romania, 61496/08, 12 January 2016 .......................................................... no. 192

Refusal to order child’s return pursuant to Hague Convention in view of abducting mother’s unwillingness to return with child: violation
  K.J. v. Poland, 30813/14, 1 March 2016 ............................................................................ no. 194

Refusal to prosecute for joke made during television comedy show about homosexual celebrity referred to as a “female”: no violation
  Sousa Goucha v. Portugal, 70434/12, 22 March 2016 ........................................................ no. 194

Inadequate investigation into racist abuse directed at woman of Roma origin: violation
  R.B. v. Hungary, 64602/12, 12 April 2016 ........................................................................... no. 195

Inadequacy of measures taken by State to secure father’s right of access to his children pursuant to court order: violation
  Fourkiotis v. Greece, 74758/11, 16 June 2016 ................................................................. no. 197

Lack of appropriate legal framework to protect occupant of flat from harassment by co-owners: violation
  Irina Smirnova v. Ukraine, 1870/05, 13 October 2016 ....................................................... no. 200

Inability of man claiming to be biological father to contest paternity of child whose paternity had already been recognised by another man: violation

Expulsion

Proposed deportation of person suffering from serious illness to his country of origin in face of doubts as to the availability of appropriate medical treatment there: expulsion would have constituted a violation
  Paposhvili v. Belgium [GC], 41738/10, 13 December 2016 ............................................. no. 202

Asylum-seeker living under precarious conditions for years owing to continuing failure of highest appellate authority to decide his appeal: violation
  B.A.C. v. Greece, 11981/15, 13 October 2016 ................................................................ no. 200

ARTICLE 9

Freedom of thought

Assessment of the genuineness of an objection to military service by commission composed of majority of military officers: violation
  Papavasilakis v. Greece, 66899/14, 15 September 2016 ..................................................... no. 199

Freedom of conscience

Conscientious objection to military service not based on genuine religious convictions: inadmissible
  Enver Aydemir v. Turkey, 26012/11, 7 June 2016 .............................................................. no. 197
Assessment of the genuineness of an objection to military service by commission composed of majority of military officers: violation

*Papavasilakis v. Greece, 66899/14, 15 September 2016* ............................................................. no. 199

**Freedom of religion**

Refusal by prison authorities in separatist region of the Republic of Moldova to allow prisoner to see pastor: no violation; violation

*Mozer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC], 11138/10, 23 February 2016* ........ no. 193

Refusal to provide public religious services to members of Alevi faith: violation

*İzzettin Doğan and Others v. Turkey [GC], 62649/10, 26 April 2016* ........................................... no. 195

Planning restrictions making it impossible for small religious community to have a place of worship: violation

*Association for Solidarity with Jehovah’s Witnesses and Others v. Turkey, 36915/10 and 8606/13, 24 May 2016* ......................................................................................... no. 196

Conscientious objection to military service not based on genuine religious convictions: inadmissible

*Enver Aydemir v. Turkey, 26012/11, 7 June 2016* ................................................................. no. 197

**Manifest religion or belief**

Refusal to provide public religious services to members of Alevi faith: violation

*İzzettin Doğan and Others v. Turkey [GC], 62649/10, 26 April 2016* ........................................... no. 195

Refusal to grant applicant leave from house arrest to attend Mass: no violation

*Süveges v. Hungary, 50255/12, 5 January 2016* ................................................................. no. 192

**ARTICLE 10**

**Freedom of expression**

Fine imposed on opposition MPs for showing billboards and using a megaphone during parliamentary votes: violation

*Karácsony and Others v. Hungary [GC], 42461/13 and 44357/13, 17 May 2016* .................. no. 196

Premature termination of Supreme Court President’s mandate as a result of views expressed publicly in his professional capacity: violation

*Baka v. Hungary [GC], 20261/12, 23 June 2016* ................................................................. no. 197

NGOs liable for defamation of public servant for sending private letter of complaint to a local authority which was then published in the press: case referred to the Grand Chamber

*Medžlis Islamske Zajednice Brčko and Others v. Bosnia and Herzegovina, 17224/11 (Chamber judgment of 13 October 2015)* ................................................................. no. 194

Search and seizure operation conducted to identify journalistic source: violation

*Görmiş and Others v. Turkey, 49085/07, 19 January 2016* ........................................................ no. 192
Civil award of damages against journalist for comments criticising quality of medical care received by Prime Minister: violation

_Erdener v. Turkey, 23497/05, 2 February 2016_..................................................................................no. 193

Objective liability of Internet portals for third-party comments: violation

_Magyar Tartalomszolgáltatók Egyesülete and Index.hu Zrt v. Hungary, 22947/13, 2 February 2016_...................................................................................................................no. 193

Court order to black out photograph of captive and tortured person in magazine on sale: no violation

_Société de Conception de Presse et d’Édition v. France, 4683/11, 25 February 2016_ ........no. 193

Detention and administrative conviction of solo demonstrators for breach of prior-notification requirement: violation

_Novikova and Others v. Russia, 25501/07 et al., 26 April 2016_..........................................................no. 195

Criminal conviction and imposition of a fine on journalist for article mocking local government officials: violation

_Ziemiński v. Poland (no. 2), 1799/07, 5 July 2016_..............................................................................no. 198

Failure of political party chair to prevent congress delegates from speaking in Kurdish: Article 10 applicable; violation

_Semir Güzel v. Turkey, 29483/09, 13 September 2016_........................................................................no. 199

Dismissal of diplomats for alleging in public that a presidential election had been fraudulent: no violation

_Karapetyan and Others v. Armenia, 59001/08, 17 November 2016_..............................................no. 201

Conviction of journalists for satirical publication found to be insulting to regional prosecutor: violation

_Grebeeva and Alisimchik v. Russia, 8918/05, 22 November 2016_..................................................no. 201

Seizure and confiscation for more than five years of all copies of edition of a magazine containing article on “pornography”: violation

_Kaos GL v. Turkey, 4982/07, 22 November 2016_..............................................................................no. 201

Conviction of journalist for taking weapon on board aircraft with a view to exposing security flaws: inadmissible

_Erdtmann v. Germany (dec.), 56328/10, 5 January 2016_.................................................................no. 192

Journalists fined for purchasing a firearm to illustrate an article they were writing on the local black market in weapons: inadmissible

_Saliwu and Others v. Sweden (dec.), 33628/15, 10 May 2016_.........................................................no. 196

**Freedom to impart information**

Conviction of a journalist for the publication of materials covered by the secrecy of a pending investigation: no violation

_Bédat v. Switzerland [GC], 56925/08, 29 March 2016_.................................................................no. 194

Conviction of television company for defamation for broadcasting report implicating Saudi Prince in attacks of 11 September 2001: violation

_De Carolis and France Télévisions v. France, 29313/10, 21 January 2016_.................................no. 192
Objective liability of Internet portals for third-party comments: violation

Magyar Tartalomszolgáltatók Egyesülete and Index.hu Zrt v. Hungary, 22947/13, 2 February 2016 .................................................................no. 193

Conviction of journalist for broadcasting recording of court hearing without permission: violation

Pinto Coelho v. Portugal (no. 2), 48718/11, 22 March 2016 .................................................................no. 194

**Freedom to receive information**

Conviction of a journalist for the publication of materials covered by the secrecy of a pending investigation: no violation

Bédat v. Switzerland [GC], 56925/08, 29 March 2016 ...........................................................................no. 194

Authorities’ refusal to provide an NGO conducting a survey with the names of public defenders and the number of their appointments: violation

Magyar Helsinki Bizottság v. Hungary [GC], 18030/11, 8 November 2016 .......................no. 201

Restrictions placed on prisoner’s access to Internet sites containing legal information: violation

Kalda v. Estonia, 17429/10, 19 January 2016 .............................................................................no. 192

Conviction of journalists for possessing and using radio equipment to intercept confidential police communications: no violation

Brambilla and Others v. Italy, 22567/09, 23 June 2016 .................................................................no. 197

**ARTICLE 11**

**Freedom of peaceful assembly**

Authorities’ failure to communicate with the leaders of a protest demonstration in order to ensure its peaceful conduct: violation

Frumkin v. Russia, 74568/12, 5 January 2016 .............................................................................no. 192

Imposition of lengthy prison sentence on a minor for taking part in and throwing stones at a demonstration: violation

Gülcü v. Turkey, 17526/10, 19 January 2016 .............................................................................no. 192

Administrative conviction and detention of opposition members aimed at preventing them from participating in a demonstration and punishing them for their political activity: violation

Huseynli and Others v. Azerbaijan, 67360/11, 67964/11 and 69379/11, 11 February 2016 .................................................................no. 193

Insufficient judicial scrutiny of use of force by police to disperse peaceful demonstrations: violation

Süleyman Çelebi and Others v. Turkey, 37273/10 et al., 24 May 2016 ..................................................no. 196

Conviction and sentence of protester for participation in mass disorder: violation

Yaroslav Belousov v. Russia, 2653/13 and 60980/14, 4 October 2016 ..................................................no. 200
**Freedom of association**

Dissolution on grounds that it supported terrorism of a political party advocating a peaceful solution to the Kurdish problem: **violation**

*Party for a Democratic Society (DTP) and Others v. Turkey, 3840/10 et al., 12 January 2016*.

Legally unforeseeable and thus unlawful confiscation of political party’s assets: **violation**

*Cumhuriyet Halk Partisi v. Turkey, 19920/13, 26 April 2016*.

Alleged breach of applicant company’s negative right to freedom of association: **no violation**

*Geotech Kancev GmbH v. Germany, 23646/09, 2 June 2016*.

Dissolution of association of football supporters as a result of repeated acts of violence by members resulting in supporter’s death: **no violation**

*Les Authentiks and Supras Auteuil 91 v. France, 4696/11 and 4703/11, 27 October 2016*.

Alleged inability of trade union to engage in collective bargaining owing to abolition of the relevant wages council: **inadmissible**

*Unite the Union v. the United Kingdom (dec.), 65397/13, 3 May 2016*.

---

**ARTICLE 12**

**Right to marry**

Undue delays in providing prisoner with divorce certificate required for remarriage: **violation**

*Chernetskiy v. Ukraine, 44316/07, 8 December 2016*.

---

**ARTICLE 13**

**Effective remedy**

Lack of effective domestic remedies to complain of breach of Convention rights for person detained in separatist region of the Republic of Moldova: **no violation; violation**

*Mozer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC], 11138/10, 23 February 2016*.

Lack of suspensive effect of remedy for alleged collective expulsion: **no violation**

*Khlaifia and Others v. Italy [GC], 16483/12, 15 December 2016*.

---

Lack of suspensive effect of remedy for collective expulsions: **case referred to the Grand Chamber**

*Khlaifia and Others v. Italy, 16483/12 (Chamber judgment of 1 September 2015)*.

Effectiveness of “Pinto” remedy for length of administrative proceedings where no application for expedited hearing was made: **violation**

*Olivieri and Others v. Italy, 17708/12 et al., 25 February 2016*.
No requirement under Article 13 for States to set up second level of appeal with suspensive effect in asylum cases: *no violation*

*A.M. v. the Netherlands*, 29094/09, 5 July 2016......................................................................................no. 198

---

-Alleged inability to challenge applicants’ deportation orders: *inadmissible*

*Sakkal and Fares v. Turkey (dec.),* 52902/15, 7 June 2016.................................................................no. 197

---

-Alleged lack of effective remedy for holders of public office exposed as collaborators of communist regime on basis of former security-service records: *communicated*

*Anchev v. Bulgaria*, 38334/08.......................................................................................................................no. 202

### ARTICLE 14

**Discrimination (Article 2)**

Persistent climate of impunity in matters of domestic violence, mainly to the detriment of women: *violation*

*Halime Kılıç v. Turkey*, 63034/11, 28 June 2016......................................................................................no. 198

---

-Presidential pardon and release of convicted murderer following his transfer to Azerbaijan to serve remainder of sentence imposed in Hungary for ethnically motivated crimes: *communicated*

*Makuchyan and Minasyan v. Azerbaijan and Hungary*, 17247/13...............................................................no. 193

**Discrimination (Article 3)**

-Lack of access to protection measures against domestic violence for divorced or unmarried women: *violation*

*M.G. v. Turkey*, 646/10, 22 March 2016..................................................................................................no. 194

-Failure to take into account possible discriminatory motives in investigation of homophobic attack: *violation*

*M.C. and A.C. v. Romania*, 12060/12, 12 April 2016..................................................................................no. 195

**Discrimination (Article 8)**

-More favourable conditions for family reunion applying to persons who had held Danish citizenship for at least 28 years: *violation*

*Biao v. Denmark [GC]*, 38590/10, 24 May 2016.......................................................................................no. 196

---

-Method of calculation of invalidity benefits which in practice was discriminatory against women: *violation*

*Di Trizio v. Switzerland*, 7186/09, 2 February 2016 ..................................................................................no. 193

-Discrimination between unmarried same-sex couples and unmarried different-sex couples in obtaining family reunification: *violation*

*Pajić v. Croatia*, 68453/13, 23 February 2016............................................................................................no. 193
Difference in treatment of HIV-positive aliens regarding application for residence permit and permanent ban on re-entering Russia: violation
Novruk and Others v. Russia, 31039/11 et al., 15 March 2016 ........................................ no. 194

Refusal to prosecute for joke made during television comedy show about homosexual celebrity referred to as a “female”: no violation
Sousa Goucha v. Portugal, 70434/12, 22 March 2016 ........................................................ no. 194

Difference in rights to retrospective survivor’s pension between same-sex couples and unmarried different-sex couples: no violation
Aldeguer Tomás v. Spain, 35214/09, 14 June 2016 ............................................................ no. 197

Refusal to grant a residence permit for family reunion to a same-sex foreign partner: violation
Taddeucci and McCall v. Italy, 51362/09, 30 June 2016 ................................................... no. 197

**Discrimination (Article 9)**

Difference in treatment between members of Alevi faith and citizens adhering to majority branch of Islam: violation
İzzettin Doğan and Others v. Turkey [GC], 62649/10, 26 April 2016................................. no. 195

**Discrimination (Article 1 of Protocol No. 1)**

Difference in treatment between publicly and privately employed retirees and between various categories of civil servants as regards payment of old-age pension: case referred to the Grand Chamber
Fábián v. Hungary, 78117/13 (Chamber judgment of 15 December 2015) ....................... no. 196

Failure to take account of the needs of child with disabilities when determining applicant father’s eligibility for tax relief on the purchase of suitably adapted property: violation
Guberina v. Croatia, 23682/13, 22 March 2016................................................................. no. 194

Difference in rights to retrospective survivor’s pension between same-sex couples and unmarried different-sex couples: no violation
Aldeguer Tomás v. Spain, 35214/09, 14 June 2016 ............................................................ no. 197

Alleged discrimination of Gurkha Soldiers as regards their pension entitlement: no violation
British Gurkha Welfare Society and Others v. the United Kingdom, 44818/11, 15 September 2016 ........................................................ no. 199

**Discrimination (Article 2 of Protocol no. 1)**

Refusal by academy of music to enrol blind person despite her having passed competitive entrance examination: violation
Çam v. Turkey, 51500/08, 23 February 2016 ...................................................................... no. 193

**Discrimination (Article 3 of Protocol No. 1)**

Application of 5% threshold in parliamentary elections in Lower Saxony: no violation
Partei Die Friesen v. Germany, 65480/10, 28 January 2016 .............................................. no. 192
ARTICLE 18

Restriction for unauthorised purposes

Pre-trial detention of politician and leader of opposition party, allegedly performed only to exclude him from the political life of the country: case referred to the Grand Chamber

*Merabishvili v. Georgia, 72508/13 (Chamber judgment of 14 June 2016)* ............................no. 200

Human-rights activist arrested and detained for reasons other than those prescribed by the Convention: violation

*Rasul Jafarov v. Azerbaijan, 69981/14, 17 March 2016* ..............................................................no. 194

Pre-trial detention of politician and leader of opposition party, allegedly performed only to exclude him from the political life of the country: violation

*Merabishvili v. Georgia, 72508/13, 14 June 2016* ...............................................................no. 197

Limitation on use of restrictions on rights

Allegedly improper restriction of rights under Articles 6 and 7 of the Convention: inadmissible

*Navalnyy and Ofitserov v. Russia, 46632/13 and 28671/14, 23 February 2016* ....................no. 193

ARTICLE 33

Inter-State application

Request for revision of Court’s judgment of 18 January 1978: questions communicated

*Ireland v. the United Kingdom, 5310/71* ............................................................................no. 194

ARTICLE 34

Locus standi

Standing of non-governmental organisation to lodge application on behalf of deceased children: absence of victim status

*Bulgarian Helsinki Committee v. Bulgaria (dec.), 35653/12 and 66172/12, 28 June 2016* ................................................no. 198

Victim

*Locus standi* of heirs to make Article 3 complaint on behalf of man who died before application to the Court was lodged: victim status upheld

*Boacă and Others v. Romania, 40355/11, 12 January 2016* .................................no. 192

Standing of mother to make complaint under Article 3 of the Convention on behalf of her son who died while in detention

*Karpylenko v. Ukraine, 15509/12, 11 February 2016* .............................................................no. 193

Lack of effective and sufficient redress for death of applicant’s son: victim status upheld

*Mučibabić v. Serbia, 34661/07, 12 July 2016* ............................................................no. 198
Standing of non-governmental organisation to lodge application on behalf of deceased children: *absence of victim status*

*Bulgarian Helsinki Committee v. Bulgaria (dec.), 35653/12 and 66172/12, 28 June 2016* .................................................................................................................................................................................... no. 198

**ARTICLE 35**

**Article 35 § 1**

**Exhaustion of domestic remedies**

Application for compensation under Law no. 1545 (1998) in Moldova not effective remedy in respect of unlawful detention in separatist region: *preliminary objection dismissed*

*Mozzer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC], 11138/10, 23 February 2016* ............ no. 193

Application alleging violation of Article 2 of the Convention lodged less than six months after final decision in civil proceedings but more than six months after final decision in criminal proceedings: *inadmissible*

*Jørgensen and Others v. Denmark (dec.), 30173/12, 28 June 2016* ....................................................... no. 199

Failure to use new cassation appeal procedure in commercial proceedings introduced by Constitutional Amendment Act No. 2-FKZ: *inadmissible*

*Sakhanov v. Russia (dec.), 16559/16, 18 October 2016* ................................................................. no. 201

Possibility to challenge measures taken on the basis of legislative-decrees adopted under state-of-emergency regime: *inadmissible*

*Zihni v. Turkey (dec.), 59061/16, 29 November 2016* .............................................................................. no. 202

**Effective domestic remedy – Republic of Moldova**

Application for compensation under Law no. 1545 (1998) in Moldova not effective remedy in respect of unlawful detention in separatist region: *preliminary objection dismissed*

*Mozzer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC], 11138/10, 23 February 2016* ............ no. 193

**Effective domestic remedy – Russia**

New cassation appeal procedure in criminal proceedings introduced by Federal Law no. 433-FZ did not constitute an effective remedy requiring exhaustion: *inadmissible*

*Kashlan v. Russia (dec.), 60189/15, 19 April 2016* ....................................................................................... no. 196

Failure to use new cassation appeal procedure in commercial proceedings introduced by Constitutional Amendment Act No. 2-FKZ: *inadmissible*

*Sakhanov v. Russia (dec.), 16559/16, 18 October 2016* ................................................................. no. 201

**Six-month period**

New cassation appeal procedure in criminal proceedings introduced by Federal Law no. 433-FZ did not constitute an effective remedy requiring exhaustion: *inadmissible*

*Kashlan v. Russia (dec.), 60189/15, 19 April 2016* ....................................................................................... no. 196
Application alleging violation of Article 2 of the Convention lodged less than six months after final decision in civil proceedings but more than six months after final decision in criminal proceedings: inadmissible

Jørgensen and Others v. Denmark (dec.), 30173/12, 28 June 2016 ............................................. no. 199

Article 35 § 3 (a)

Manifestly ill-founded

Failure to provide prima facie evidence in support of complaints about destruction of property in context of armed conflict: inadmissible

Lisnyy and Others v. Ukraine and Russia (dec.), 5355/15, 5 July 2016 ........................................ no. 198

Article 35 § 3 (b)

No significant disadvantage

Discrimination with respect to enjoyment of right to fair trial: inadmissible

Kiril Zlatkov Nikolov v. France, 70474/11 and 68038/12, 10 November 2016 ....................... no. 201

Complaint that national courts had failed to recognise that a pupil’s temporary suspension from school in breach of his procedural rights under domestic law also constituted a violation of his rights under Article 2 of Protocol No. 1: inadmissible

C.P. v. the United Kingdom (dec.), 300/11, 6 September 2016 ................................................. no. 199

ARTICLE 37

Striking out applications

Continuing obligation of the respondent State to investigate Article 3 complaints even following a decision striking out the complaint following a unilateral declaration

Jeronovičs v. Latvia [GC], 44898/10, 5 July 2016 ................................................................. no. 198

Assurance that the applicant would not be expelled on the basis of the expulsion order which was the subject of the application: struck out

Khan v. Germany [GC], 38030/12, 21 September 2016 ......................................................... no. 199

Applicants’ failure to keep in touch with their lawyer: struck out

V.M. and Others v. Belgium [GC], 60125/11, 17 November 2016 ........................................ no. 201

Exceptional circumstances justifying unilateral declaration in absence of prior attempt to reach a friendly settlement: struck out following unilateral declaration

Telegraaf Media Nederland Landelijke Media B.V. and van der Graaf v. the Netherlands (dec.), 33847/11, 30 August 2016 ................................................................. no. 199

Complaint concerning adequacy of domestic compensation scheme set up for the “erased”: struck out; pilot judgment closed

Anastasov and Others v. Slovenia (dec.), 65020/13, 18 October 2016 ...................................... no. 201
Special circumstances requiring further examination

Procedural issues justifying continued examination of complaint despite expiration of deportation order: request to strike out dismissed

_F.G. v. Sweden [GC], 43611/11, 23 March 2016_ .................................................................no. 194

ARTICLE 41

Just satisfaction

Pecuniary damage incurred by the applicant shareholder as a result of the unlawful takeover of a bank

_Reisner v. Turkey (just satisfaction), 46815/09, 1 December 2016_ ......................................no. 202

ARTICLE 46

Pilot judgment – General measures

Respondent State required to reduce number of detainees held in prison psychiatric wings without access to suitable therapeutic treatment

_W.D v. Belgium, 73548/13, 6 September 2016_ .................................................................no. 199

Execution of judgment

Rejection by Supreme Court of request for revision of criminal judgment following judgment of European Court finding violation of Article 6 of the Convention: relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber

_Moreira Ferreira v. Portugal (no 2.), 19867/12_ .................................................................no. 192

Execution of judgment – General measures

Respondent State required to continue to adopt measures to address structural problem relating to excessive length of pre-trial detention

_Zherebin v. Russia, 51445/09, 24 March 2016_ .................................................................no. 194

Respondent State reminded that senior officials should not be excluded from scope of judicial scrutiny of use of force by security forces

_Süleyman Çelebi and Others v. Turkey, 37273/10 et al., 24 May 2016_ ............................no. 196

Respondent State required to identify causes of structural malfunctioning of health service, find appropriate solutions and change the rules governing forensic medical expert reports

_Aydoğdu v. Turkey, 40448/06, 30 August 2016_ .................................................................no. 199

Respondent State required to take general measures to ensure judicial impartiality in administrative-offence proceedings

_Karelin v. Russia, 926/08, 20 September 2016_ .................................................................no. 199

Respondent State required to take further measures to eliminate structural problems relating to pre-trial detention

_Ignatov v. Ukraine, 40583/15, 15 December 2016_ .............................................................no. 202
ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

Possessions

Claims to ownership of socially owned property through adverse possession: cases referred to the Grand Chamber

Jakeljić v. Croatia, 22768/12 (Chamber judgment of 28 June 2016) ..................................................no. 201

Radomilja and Others v. Croatia, 37685/10 (Chamber judgment of 28 June 2016) ...............no. 201

Refusal to grant compensation for accidental public-works damage to building erected without permission: violation

Keriman Tekin and Others v. Turkey, 22035/10, 15 November 2016 ...............................................no. 201

Payment of partial compensation rather than full expropriation value for land encumbered by material and legal restrictions owing to nearby construction of hydraulic dam: violation

Kutlu and Others v. Turkey, 51861/11, 13 December 2016 ............................................................no. 202

Peaceful enjoyment of possessions

Loss of disability benefits due to newly introduced eligibility criteria: violation


Claims to ownership of socially owned property through adverse possession: cases referred to the Grand Chamber

Jakeljić v. Croatia, 22768/12 (Chamber judgment of 28 June 2016) ..................................................no. 201

Radomilja and Others v. Croatia, 37685/10 (Chamber judgment of 28 June 2016) ...............no. 201

Five-year instalment payment plan set up to remedy delays in compensation for war-related property loss: no violation

Lukats v. Romania, 24199/07, 5 April 2016 ......................................................................................no. 195

Automatic forfeiture of applicant’s civil-service pension following disciplinary proceedings resulting in his dismissal: no violation

Philippou v. Cyprus, 71148/10, 14 June 2016 ..................................................................................no. 197

Rescheduling of national debt entailing decrease in nominal value of bonds without consent of private investors: no violation

Mamatas and Others v. Greece, 63066/14, 64297/14 and 66106/14, 21 July 2016 .......................no. 198

Costs ordered in civil proceedings amounted to disproportionate burden: violation

Cindrić and Beštić v. Croatia, 72152/13, 6 September 2016 ..........................................................no. 199

Unreasonably high repurchase price demanded for expropriated land compared to compensation paid for the expropriation: violation

Kanaginis v. Greece, 27662/09, 27 October 2016 ..........................................................................no. 200

Refusal to grant compensation for accidental public-works damage to building erected without permission: violation

Keriman Tekin and Others v. Turkey, 22035/10, 15 November 2016 ...............................................no. 201

-ooo-
Inability of public servant who did not qualify for a pension to obtain reimbursement of her pension contributions: inadmissible

*Mauriello v. Italy (dec.), 14862/07, 13 September 2016* ................................................................. **no. 200**

**Deprivation of property**

Failure to pay interest on final instalment of compensation for expropriation despite the owner being deprived of possession after payment of the provisional instalment: violation

*Dökmeci v. Turkey, 74155/14, 6 December 2016* ................................................................. **no. 202**

**Control of the use of property**

Order for demolition of applicants’ home for breach of building regulations: demolition would not constitute a violation

*Ivanova and Cherkezov v. Bulgaria, 46577/15, 21 April 2016* ........................................................ **no. 195**

Order for provisional seizure of assets in criminal proceedings without an assessment of the proportionality of the measure: violation

*Džinić v. Croatia, 38359/13, 17 May 2016* ................................................................. **no. 196**

Court order requiring copyright manager to enter into licence agreement with two radio stations and to set an equitable royalty rate: no violation

*SIA AKKA/LAA v. Latvia, 562/05, 12 July 2016* ................................................................. **no. 198**

Confiscation of revenue for period in which company continued, without requisite permits, activity affecting environment: no violation


**ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 1**

**Free expression of the opinion of the people**

Refusal to terminate mandate of European Parliament members elected as a result of eligibility threshold declared unconstitutional: inadmissible

*Strack and Richter v. Germany (dec.), 28811/12 and 50303/12, 5 July 2016* .................................. **no. 199**

**Stand for election**

Removal of members of parliament from office on account of words or deeds that led to dissolution of their political party: violation

*Party for a Democratic Society (DTP) and Others v. Turkey, 3840/10 et al., 12 January 2016* ................................................................. **no. 192**

House arrest of candidate politician during parliamentary elections: no violation

*Uspaskich v. Lithuania, 14737/08, 20 December 2016* ................................................................. **no. 202**
ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 4

Article 2 § 1

Freedom to choose residence

Policy imposing length-of-residence and type of income conditions on persons wishing to settle in inner-city area of Rotterdam: case referred to the Grand Chamber

Garib v. the Netherlands, 43494/09 (Chamber judgment of 23 February 2016) ..................no. 199

Policy imposing length-of-residence and type of income conditions on persons wishing to settle in inner-city area of Rotterdam: no violation

Garib v. the Netherlands, 43494/09, 23 February 2016......................................................no. 193

ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL No. 4

Prohibition of collective expulsion of aliens

Removal to Tunisia of large group of Tunisian sea-migrants after each had been identified individually and allowed to raise any personal objections: no violation

Khlaifia and Others v. Italy [GC], 16483/12, 15 December 2016..........................................no. 202

Alleged collective expulsion of migrants to Tunisia: case referred to the Grand Chamber

Khlaifia and Others v. Italy, 16483/12 (Chamber judgment of 1 September 2015) ...............no. 193

ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL No. 7

Right not to be tried or punished twice

Parallel administrative and criminal proceedings in respect of the same conduct: no violation

A and B v. Norway [GC], 24130/11 and 29758/11, 15 November 2016...............................no. 201

Revocation of firearms licence by police authority following conviction for assault: inadmissible

Palmén v. Sweden (dec.), 38292/15, 22 March 2016............................................................no. 195

ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 12

General prohibition of discrimination

Ineligibility of Bosniac living in the Republika Srpska to stand for election to the national presidency: violation

Pilav v. Bosnia and Herzegovina, 41939/07, 9 June 2016 .......................................................no. 197
CASES ACCEPTED FOR REFERAL TO THE GRAND CHAMBER
AND CASES IN WHICH JURISDICTION WAS RELINQUISHED
BY A CHAMBER IN FAVOUR OF THE GRAND CHAMBER

REFERRALS

Bărbulescu v. Romania, 61496/08 (Chamber judgment of 12 January 2016)......................... no. 197
ARTICLE 8: RESPECT FOR PRIVATE LIFE – RESPECT FOR CORRESPONDENCE – POSITIVE OBLIGATIONS
Monitoring of an employee’s use of the Internet at his place of work and use of data collected to justify his dismissal: case referred to the Grand Chamber

Fábián v. Hungary, 78117/13 (Chamber judgment of 15 December 2015)........................... no. 196
ARTICLE 14: DISCRIMINATION (ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1)
Difference in treatment between publicly and privately employed retirees and between various categories of civil servants as regards payment of old-age pension: case referred to the Grand Chamber

Garib v. the Netherlands, 43494/09 (Chamber judgment of 23 February 2016)..................... no. 199
ARTICLE 2 § 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 4: FREEDOM TO CHOOSE RESIDENCE
Policy imposing length-of-residence and type of income conditions on persons wishing to settle in inner-city area of Rotterdam: case referred to the Grand Chamber

Jakeljić v. Croatia, 22768/12 (Chamber judgment of 28 June 2016)..................................... no. 201
ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1: POSSESSIONS – PEACEFUL ENJOYMENT OF POSSESSIONS
Claims to ownership of socially owned property through adverse possession: cases referred to the Grand Chamber

Károly Nagy v. Hungary, 56665/09 (Chamber judgment of 1 December 2015)...................... no. 196
ARTICLE 6 § 1 (CIVIL): ACCESS TO COURT
Supreme Court ruling that civil courts had no jurisdiction to hear pastor’s claim for wrongful dismissal by church: case referred to the Grand Chamber

Khlaifia and Others v. Italy, 16483/12 (Chamber judgment of 1 September 2015)................ no. 193
ARTICLE 13: EFFECTIVE REMEDY
Lack of suspensive effect of remedy for collective expulsions: case referred to the Grand Chamber
ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL No. 4: PROHIBITION OF COLLECTIVE EXPULSION OF ALIENS
Alleged collective expulsion of migrants to Tunisia: case referred to the Grand Chamber

Lopes de Sousa Fernandes v. Portugal, 56080/13 (Chamber judgment of 15 December 2015) ... no. 196
ARTICLE 2: POSITIVE OBLIGATIONS (SUBSTANTIVE ASPECT) – POSITIVE OBLIGATIONS (PROCEDURAL ASPECT)
Patient allegedly deprived of access to appropriate emergency care as a result of a lack of coordination between departments of a public hospital: case referred to the Grand Chamber
Medžlis Islamske Zajednice Brčko and Others v. Bosnia and Herzegovina, 17224/11
(Chamber judgment of 13 October 2015) .................................................................no. 194

**ARTICLE 10: FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION**

NGOs liable for defamation of public servant for sending private letter of complaint to a
local authority which was then published in the press: case referred to the Grand Chamber

Merabishvili v. Georgia, 72508/13 (Chamber judgment of 14 June 2016) .......................no. 200

**ARTICLE 18: RESTRICTION FOR UNAUTHORISED PURPOSES**

Pre-trial detention of politician and leader of opposition party, allegedly performed only to
exclude him from the political life of the country: case referred to the Grand Chamber

Nagmetov v. Russia, 35589/08 (Chamber judgment of 5 November 2015) ......................no. 194

**ARTICLE 2: USE OF FORCE – EFFECTIVE INVESTIGATION**

Unlawful killing of applicant’s son by police during demonstration and ineffective
investigation: case referred to the Grand Chamber

Naït-Liman v. Switzerland, 51357/07 (Chamber judgment of 21 June 2016) .....................no. 201

**ARTICLE 6 § 1 (CIVIL): ACCESS TO COURT**

Absence of universal jurisdiction of civil courts in torture cases: case referred to the Grand Chamber

Radomilja and Others v. Croatia, 37685/10 (Chamber judgment of 28 June 2016) ..............no. 201

**ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1: POSSESSIONS – PEACEFUL ENJOYMENT OF POSSESSIONS**

Claims to ownership of socially owned property through adverse possession: cases referred
to the Grand Chamber

Ramos Nunes de Carvalho e Sá v. Portugal, 55391/13, 57728/13 and 74041/13 (Chamber
judgment of 21 June 2016) ......................................................................................no. 200

**ARTICLE 6 § 1 (ADMINISTRATIVE): PUBLIC HEARING – INDEPENDENT AND IMPARTIAL TRIBUNAL**

Limited scope of review by Supreme Court of Judicial Services Commission’s decisions in
disciplinary proceedings: case referred to the Grand Chamber

Regner v. the Czech Republic, 35289/11 (Chamber judgment of 26 November 2015) ............no. 196

**ARTICLE 6 § 1 (ADMINISTRATIVE): ADVERSARIAL TRIAL – EQUALITY OF ARMS**

Lack of access to classified information constituting decisive evidence in judicial-review
proceedings: case referred to the Grand Chamber

Simeonovi v. Bulgaria, 21980/04 (Chamber judgment of 20 October 2015) ........................no. 194

**ARTICLE 6 § 3 (C): DEFENCE THROUGH LEGAL ASSISTANCE**

Lack of access to a lawyer during first three days of detention: case referred to the Grand Chamber

**RELINQUISHMENTS**

Correia de Matos v. Portugal, 56402/12 ..................................................................................no. 199

**ARTICLE 6 § 3 (C): DEFENCE THROUGH LEGAL ASSISTANCE**

Lawyer not permitted to conduct his own defence in criminal proceedings: relinquishment
in favour of the Grand Chamber
Harkins v. the United Kingdom, 71537/14 .............................................................. no. 198

ARTICLE 3: EXTRADITION

Proposed extradition to United States where applicant faced life imprisonment without parole: relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber

Moreira Ferreira v. Portugal (no 2.), 19867/12 ............................................................... no. 192

ARTICLE 6 § 1 (CRIMINAL): ACCESS TO COURT
ARTICLE 46: EXECUTION OF JUDGMENT

Rejection by Supreme Court of request for revision of criminal judgment following judgment of European Court finding violation of Article 6 of the Convention: relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber
CASES LISTED ALPHABETICALLY BY RESPONDENT STATE

Andora __________________________________________________________________________

Judgments
Gouarré Patte v. Andorra, 33427/10, 12 January 2016 ...................................................... no. 192

Armenia __________________________________________________________________________

Judgments
Karapetyan and Others v. Armenia, 59001/08, 17 November 2016 ........................................ no. 201
Vardanyan and Nanushyan v. Armenia, 8001/07, 27 October 2016 ................................... no. 200

Austria __________________________________________________________________________

Decisions
Ahunbay and Others v. Turkey, Austria and Germany (dec.), 6080/06, 21 June 2016 ...... no. 198

Azerbaijan ________________________________________________________________________

Judgments
Huseynli and Others v. Azerbaijan, 67360/11, 67964/11 and 69379/11, 11 February 2016............................... no. 193
Rasul Jafarov v. Azerbaijan, 69981/14, 17 March 2016 .................................................. no. 194

Communicated cases
Makuchyan and Minasyan v. Azerbaijan and Hungary, 17247/13.............................. no. 193

Belgium __________________________________________________________________________

Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)
Lhermitte v. Belgium [GC], 34238/09, 29 November 2016 ............................................... no. 201
Paposhvili v. Belgium [GC], 41738/10, 13 December 2016 ............................................. no. 202
V.M. and Others v. Belgium [GC], 60125/11, 17 November 2016............................... no. 201

Judgments
W.D v. Belgium, 73548/13, 6 September 2016............................................................... no. 199

Bosnia and Herzegovina _____________________________________________________________

Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)
Medžlis Islamske Zajednice Brčko and Others v. Bosnia and Herzegovina, 17224/11
(Chamber judgment of 13 October 2015 – referral)....................................................... no. 194

Judgments
Pilav v. Bosnia and Herzegovina, 41939/07, 9 June 2016 .................................................. no. 197
Bulgaria

Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)
Simeonovi v. Bulgaria, 21980/04 (Chamber judgment of 20 October 2015 – referral)........no. 194

Judgments
D.L. v. Bulgaria, 7472/14, 19 May 2016 .................................................................no. 196
Ivanova and Cherkezov v. Bulgaria, 46577/15, 21 April 2016.................................no. 195

Decisions
Bulgarian Helsinki Committee v. Bulgaria (dec.), 35653/12 and 66172/12, 28 June 2016...............................................................................................................no. 198

Communicated cases
Anchev v. Bulgaria, 38334/08.......................................................................................no. 202

Croatia

Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)
Muršić v. Croatia [GC], 7334/13, 20 October 2016 .................................................no. 200

Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)
Jakeljić v. Croatia, 22768/12 (Chamber judgment of 28 June 2016 – referral)..........no. 201
Radomilja and Others v. Croatia, 37685/10 (Chamber judgment of 28 June 2016 – referral)..............................................no. 201

Judgments
Cindrić and Bešlić v. Croatia, 72152/13, 6 September 2016....................................no. 199
Džinić v. Croatia, 38359/13, 17 May 2016.................................................................no. 196
Guberina v. Croatia, 23682/13, 22 March 2016.......................................................no. 194
Paić v. Croatia, 47082/12, 29 March 2016.................................................................no. 194
Pajić v. Croatia, 68453/13, 23 February 2016..........................................................no. 193
Travaš v. Croatia, 75581/13, 4 October 2016............................................................no. 200
Žaja v. Croatia, 37462/09, 4 October 2016...............................................................no. 200

Cyprus

Judgments
Philippou v. Cyprus, 71148/10, 14 June 2016............................................................no. 197

Czech Republic

Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)
Dubská and Krejzová v. the Czech Republic [GC], 28859/11 and 28473/12, 15 November 2016............................................................................................................no. 201

Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)
Regner v. the Czech Republic, 35289/11 (Chamber judgment of 26 November 2015 – referral)..................................................................................................................no. 196
Denmark

Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

_Biao v. Denmark [GC], 38590/10, 24 May 2016_ ........................................................................ no. 196

Decisions

_Jørgensen and Others v. Denmark (dec.), 30173/12, 28 June 2016_ ........................................ no. 199

Estonia

Judgments

_Kalda v. Estonia, 17429/10, 19 January 2016_ ........................................................................... no. 192
_Kashlev v. Estonia, 22574/08, 26 April 2016_ .......................................................................... no. 195
_Pönkä v. Estonia, 64160/11, 8 November 2016_ ................................................................. no. 201

Finland

Communicated cases

_Kotilainen and Others v. Finland, 62439/12_ ........................................................................ no. 192

France

Judgments

_A.B. and Others v. France, 11593/12, 12 July 2016_ ............................................................... no. 198
_A.M. v. France, 56324/13, 12 July 2016_ ................................................................................ no. 198
_A.M. and Others v. France, 24587/12, 12 July 2016_ .......................................................... no. 198
_Beausoleil v. France, 63979/11, 6 October 2016_ ................................................................. no. 200
_De Carolis and France Télévisions v. France, 29313/10, 21 January 2016_ ...................... no. 192
_Kiril Zlatkov Nikolov v. France, 70474/11 and 68038/12, 10 November 2016_ ............... no. 201
_Les Authentiks and Supras Auteuil 91 v. France, 4696/11 and 4703/11, 27 October 2016_ no. 200
_Mandet v. France, 30955/12, 14 January 2016_ ................................................................. no. 192
_R.C. and V.C. v. France, 76491/14, 12 July 2016_ ............................................................... no. 198
_R.K. and Others v. France, 68264/14, 12 July 2016_ ........................................................... no. 198
_R.M. and Others v. France, 33201/11, 12 July 2016_ ........................................................ no. 198
_Société de Conception de Presse et d’Édition v. France, 4683/11, 25 February 2016_ .... no. 193
_Versini-Campinchi and Crasnianski v. France, 49176/11, 16 June 2016_ ....................... no. 197

Decisions

_Société Oxygène Plus v. France (dec.), 76959/11, 17 May 2016_ ........................................ no. 197

Georgia

Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

_Merabishvili v. Georgia, 72508/13 (Chamber judgment of 14 June 2016 – referral)_........................ no. 200

Judgments

_Merabishvili v. Georgia, 72508/13, 14 June 2016_ ............................................................... no. 197
_N.Ts. and Others v. Georgia, 71776/12, 2 February 2016_ ................................................ no. 193
Index 2016 to the Information Notes on the Court’s case-law

### Germany

#### Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Reference</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Khan v. Germany [GC], 38030/12</td>
<td>21 September 2016</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Judgments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Reference</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bergmann v. Germany, 23279/14</td>
<td>7 January 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geotech Kancev GmbH v. Germany, 23646/09</td>
<td>2 June 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K.S. and M.S. v. Germany, 33696/11</td>
<td>6 October 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kahn v. Germany, 16313/10</td>
<td>17 March 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marc Brauer v. Germany, 24062/13</td>
<td>1 September 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partei Die Friesen v. Germany, 65480/10</td>
<td>28 January 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petschulies v. Germany, 6281/13</td>
<td>2 June 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wenner v. Germany, 62303/13</td>
<td>1 September 2016</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Decisions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Reference</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ahunbay and Others v. Turkey, Austria and Germany (dec.), 6080/06</td>
<td>21 June 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erdtmann v. Germany (dec.), 56328/10</td>
<td>5 January 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Findikoglu v. Germany (dec.), 20672/15</td>
<td>7 June 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strack and Richter v. Germany (dec.), 28811/12 and 50303/12</td>
<td>5 July 2016</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Greece

#### Judgments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Reference</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B.A.C. v. Greece, 11981/15</td>
<td>13 October 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constantinides v. Greece, 76438/12</td>
<td>6 October 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fourkiotis v. Greece, 74758/11</td>
<td>16 June 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kanaginis v. Greece, 27662/09</td>
<td>27 October 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kolonja v. Greece, 49441/12</td>
<td>19 May 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L.E. v. Greece, 71545/12</td>
<td>21 January 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mamatas and Others v. Greece, 63066/14, 64297/14 and 66106/14</td>
<td>21 July 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Papaioannou v. Greece, 18880/15</td>
<td>2 June 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Papavasilakis v. Greece, 66899/14</td>
<td>15 September 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sakir v. Greece, 48475/09</td>
<td>24 March 2016</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Hungary

#### Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Reference</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baka v. Hungary [GC], 20261/12</td>
<td>23 June 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Béláné Nagy v. Hungary [GC], 53080/13</td>
<td>13 December 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karácseny and Others v. Hungary [GC], 42461/13 and 44357/13</td>
<td>17 May 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magyar Helsinki Bizottság v. Hungary [GC], 18030/11</td>
<td>8 November 2016</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Reference</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fábián v. Hungary, 78117/13</td>
<td>(Chamber judgment of 15 December 2015 – referral)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Károly Nagy v. Hungary, 56665/09 (Chamber judgment of 1 December 2015 – referral)................................................................................................................................no. 196

Judgments
Magyar Tartalomszolgáltatók Egyesülete and Index.hu Zrt v. Hungary, 22947/13, 2 February 2016................................................................................................................................no. 193
R.B. v. Hungary, 64602/12, 12 April 2016................................................................................................................................no. 195
Süveges v. Hungary, 50255/12, 5 January 2016................................................................................................................................no. 192
Szabó and Vissy v. Hungary, 37138/14, 12 January 2016................................................................................................................................no. 192
T.P. and A.T v. Hungary, 37871/14 and 73986/14, 4 October 2016 ................................................................................................................................no. 200

Communicated cases
Makuchyan and Minasyan v. Azerbaijan and Hungary, 17247/13 ................................................................................................................................no. 193

Italy

Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)
Khlaifia and Others v. Italy [GC], 16483/12, 15 December 2016................................................................................................................................no. 202

Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)
Khlaifia and Others v. Italy, 16483/12 (Chamber judgment of 1 September 2015 – referral)................................................................................................................................no. 193

Judgments
Brambilla and Others v. Italy, 22567/09, 23 June 2016................................................................................................................................no. 197
Nasr and Ghali v. Italy, 44883/09, 23 February 2016................................................................................................................................no. 193
Olivieri and Others v. Italy, 17708/12 et al., 25 February 2016................................................................................................................................no. 193
Taddeucci and McCall v. Italy, 51362/09, 30 June 2016 ................................................................................................................................no. 197
Trevisanato v. Italy, 32610/07, 15 September 2016................................................................................................................................no. 199

Decisions
Mauriello v. Italy (dec.), 14862/07, 13 September 2016................................................................................................................................no. 200

Latvia

Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)
Avotiņš v. Latvia [GC], 17502/07, 23 May 2016................................................................................................................................no. 196
Jeronovičs v. Latvia [GC], 44898/10, 5 July 2016................................................................................................................................no. 198

Judgments
SIA AKKA/LAA v. Latvia, 562/05, 12 July 2016................................................................................................................................no. 198

Lithuania

Judgments
A.N. v. Lithuania, 17280/08, 31 May 2016................................................................................................................................no. 196
Biržietis v. Lithuania, 49304/09, 14 June 2016................................................................................................................................no. 197
Naku v. Lithuania and Sweden, 26126/07, 8 November 2016................................................................................................................................no. 201
Uspaskich v. Lithuania, 14737/08, 20 December 2016 ................................................................................................................................no. 202
Malta

Judgments
Borg v. Malta, 37537/13, 12 January 2016 .........................................................no. 192
Ramadan v. Malta, 76136/12, 21 June 2016............................................................no. 197
Saliba v. Malta, 24221/13, 29 November 2016.......................................................no. 201

Moldova (Republic of)

Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)
Buzadji v. the Republic of Moldova [GC], 23755/07, 5 July 2016.............................no. 198
Mozer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC], 11138/10, 23 February 2016............no. 193

Judgments
Igor Pascari v. the Republic of Moldova, 25555/10, 30 August 2016............................no. 199
Lazu v. the Republic of Moldova, 46182/08, 5 July 2016............................................no. 198

Netherlands

Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)
Murray v. the Netherlands [GC], 10511/10, 26 April 2016........................................no. 195

Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)
Garib v. the Netherlands, 43494/09 (Chamber judgment of 23 February 2016 – referral)......no. 199

Judgments
A.M. v. the Netherlands, 29094/09, 5 July 2016............................................................no. 198
Garib v. the Netherlands, 43494/09, 23 February 2016............................................no. 193

Decisions
Telegraaf Media Nederland Landelijke Media B.V. and van der Graaf v. the Netherlands
(dec.), 33847/11, 30 August 2016...........................................................................no. 199

Norway

Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)
A and B v. Norway [GC], 24130/11 and 29758/11, 15 November 2016.........................no. 201

Poland

Judgments
K.J. v. Poland, 30813/14, 1 March 2016.................................................................no. 194
Rywin v. Poland, 6091/06, 4047/07 and 4070/07, 18 February 2016...........................no. 193
Ziembiński v. Poland (no. 2), 1799/07, 5 July 2016....................................................no. 198

Portugal

Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)
Correia de Matos v. Portugal, 56402/12 (relinquishment)...........................................no. 199
Lopes de Sousa Fernandes v. Portugal, 56080/13 (Chamber judgment of 15 December
2015 – referral)...........................................................................................................no. 196
Moreira Ferreira v. Portugal (no 2), 19867/12 (relinquishment).................................no. 192
Ramos Nunes de Carvalho e Sá v. Portugal, 55391/13, 57728/13 and 74041/13 (Chamber judgment of 21 June 2016 – referral) ..............................................................no. 200

Judgments

Pinto Coelho v. Portugal (no. 2), 48718/11, 22 March 2016 .............................................no. 194
Soares de Melo v. Portugal, 72850/14, 16 February 2016 ..................................................no. 193
Sousa Goucha v. Portugal, 70434/12, 22 March 2016 ........................................................no. 194

Romania

Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

Greek-Catholic Parish of Lupeni and Others v. Romania [GC], 76943/11, 29 November 2016 .........................................................................................................................no. 201

Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

Bărbulescu v. Romania, 61496/08 (Chamber judgment of 12 January 2016 – referral) ....no. 197

Judgments

Bărbulescu v. Romania, 61496/08, 12 January 2016 ..........................................................no. 192
Boacă and Others v. Romania, 40355/11, 12 January 2016 .............................................no. 192
Cătălin Eugen Micu v. Romania, 55104/13, 5 January 2016 .............................................no. 192
Cazan v. Romania, 30050/12, 5 April 2016 .....................................................................no. 195
Ioan Pop and Others v. Romania, 52924/09, 6 December 2016 .......................................no. 202
Lukats v. Romania, 24199/07, 5 April 2016 .....................................................................no. 195
M.C. and A.C. v. Romania, 12060/12, 12 April 2016 ......................................................no. 195

Decisions

Radi and Gherghina v. Romania (dec.), 34655/14, 5 January 2016 .....................................no. 192

Russia

Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

Blokhin v. Russia [GC], 47152/06, 23 March 2016 ..............................................................no. 194
Mozer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC], 11138/10, 23 February 2016 ..........no. 193

Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

Nagmetov v. Russia, 35589/08 (Chamber judgment of 5 November 2015 – referral) ........no. 194

Judgments

Bagdonavicius and Others v. Russia, 19841/06, 11 October 2016 ......................................no. 200
Frumkin v. Russia, 74568/12, 5 January 2016 .................................................................no. 192
Gankin and Others v. Russia, 2430/06 et al., 31 May 2016 .............................................no. 196
Grebnëva and Alisimchik v. Russia, 8918/05, 22 November 2016 .................................no. 201
Karelin v. Russia, 926/08, 20 September 2016 .................................................................no. 199
Kasparov v. Russia, 53659/07, 11 October 2016 ..............................................................no. 200
Kocherov and Sergeyeva v. Russia, 16899/13, 29 March 2016 ......................................no. 194
Kolesnikovich v. Russia, 44694/13, 22 March 2016 ........................................................no. 194
Navalnyy and Ofitserov v. Russia, 46632/13 and 28671/14, 23 February 2016...........................................no. 193
Novikova and Others v. Russia, 25501/07 et al., 26 April 2016.............................................................no. 195
Novruk and Others v. Russia, 31039/11 et al., 15 March 2016...............................................................no. 194
Topekhin v. Russia, 78774/13, 10 May 2016.......................................................................................no. 196
Trapeznikov and Others v. Russia, 5623/09 et al., 5 April 2016............................................................no. 195
Yaroslav Belousov v. Russia, 2653/13 and 60980/14, 4 October 2016..................................................no. 200
Yevdokimov and Others v. Russia, 27236/05 et al., 16 February 2016..............................................no. 193
Zherebin v. Russia, 51445/09, 24 March 2016.......................................................................................no. 194

Decisions
Lisnyy and Others v. Ukraine and Russia (dec.), 5355/15, 5 July 2016...................................................no. 198
Kashlan v. Russia (dec.), 60189/15, 19 April 2016..................................................................................no. 196
Sakhanov v. Russia (dec.), 16559/16, 18 October 2016.........................................................................no. 201

Communicated cases
L.M.P. and V.V.P. v. Ukraine and Russia, 45742/15.............................................................................no. 198
O.I.Z. and V.P.Z. v. Ukraine and Russia, 22980/16..............................................................................no. 198

Serbia

Judgments
Mučibabić v. Serbia, 34661/07, 12 July 2016.........................................................................................no. 198

Slovenia

Decisions
Anastasov and Others v. Slovenia (dec.), 65020/13, 18 October 2016.....................................................no. 201

Spain

Judgments
Aldeguer Tomás v. Spain, 35214/09, 14 June 2016.................................................................................no. 197

Sweden

Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)
F.G. v. Sweden [GC], 43611/11, 23 March 2016..................................................................................no. 194
J.K. and Others v. Sweden [GC], 59166/12, 23 August 2016...............................................................no. 199

Judgments
Arlewin v. Sweden, 22302/10, 1 March 2016.......................................................................................no. 194
Naku v. Lithuania and Sweden, 26126/07, 8 November 2016..............................................................no. 201

Decisions
Palmén v. Sweden (dec.), 38292/15, 22 March 2016..............................................................................no. 195
Salihu and Others v. Sweden (dec.), 33628/15, 10 May 2016...............................................................no. 196
Switzerland

Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

Al-Dulimi and Montana Management Inc. v. Switzerland [GC], 5809/08, 21 June 2016

Bédat v. Switzerland [GC], 56925/08, 29 March 2016

Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

Naït-Liman v. Switzerland, 51357/07 (Chamber judgment of 21 June 2016 – referral)

Judgments

Di Trizio v. Switzerland, 7186/09, 2 February 2016

Meier v. Switzerland, 10109/14, 9 February 2016

Naït-Liman v. Switzerland, 51357/07, 21 June 2016

Vukota-Bojić v. Switzerland, 61838/10, 18 October 2016

Decisions

Tabbane v. Switzerland (dec.), 41069/12, 1 March 2016

The former yugoslav Republic of Macedonia

Judgments

Gerovska Popčevska v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 48783/07, 7 January 2016

Ivanovski v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 29908/11, 21 January 2016

Jakšovski and Trifunovski v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 56381/09 and 58738/09, 7 January 2016

Kitanovska Stanojkovic and Others v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 2319/14, 13 October 2016

Mitrov v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 45959/09, 2 June 2016

Mitrova and Savik v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 42534/09, 11 February 2016

Turkey

Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

İzzettin Doğan and Others v. Turkey [GC], 62649/10, 26 April 2016

Judgments

Association for Solidarity with Jehovah’s Witnesses and Others v. Turkey, 36915/10 and 8606/13, 24 May 2016

Aydöğdu v. Turkey, 40448/06, 30 August 2016

Çam v. Turkey, 51500/08, 23 February 2016

Cangöz and Others v. Turkey, 7469/06, 26 April 2016

Cavit Tınarlogoğlu v. Turkey, 3648/04, 2 February 2016

Cevat Özel v. Turkey, 19602/06, 7 June 2016

Cevrioglu v. Turkey, 69546/12, 4 October 2016

Civek v. Turkey, 55354/11, 23 February 2016
Index 2016 to the Information Notes on the Court’s case-law

Cumhuriyet Halk Partisi v. Turkey, 19920/13, 26 April 2016..................................................no. 195
Dökmeci v. Turkey, 74155/14, 6 December 2016.................................................................no. 202
Enver Aydemir v. Turkey, 26012/11, 7 June 2016..............................................................no. 197
Erden v. Turkey, 23497/05, 2 February 2016.................................................................no. 193
Görmüş and Others v. Turkey, 49085/07, 19 January 2016..............................................no. 192
Gülcü v. Turkey, 17526/10, 19 January 2016..............................................................no. 192
Halime Kılıç v. Turkey, 63034/11, 28 June 2016........................................................no. 198
Kaşas GL v. Turkey, 4982/07, 22 November 2016.............................................................no. 201
Karabeyoğlu v. Turkey, 30083/10, 7 June 2016.............................................................no. 197
Keriman Tekin and Others v. Turkey, 22035/10, 15 November 2016............................no. 201
Kerman v. Turkey, 35132/05, 22 November 2016.............................................................no. 201
Kutlu and Others v. Turkey, 51861/11, 13 December 2016..............................................no. 202
M.G. v. Turkey, 646/10, 22 March 2016..............................................................no. 194
Öztünç v. Turkey, 14777/08, 9 February 2016...............................................................no. 193
Party for a Democratic Society (DTP) and Others v. Turkey, 3840/10 et al., 12 January 2016...no. 192
Reisner v. Turkey (just satisfaction), 46815/09, 1 December 2016.........................................no. 202
Şahin Kış v. Turkey, 33160/04, 7 June 2016..............................................................no. 197
Semir Güzel v. Turkey, 29483/09, 13 September 2016......................................................no. 199
Sodan v. Turkey, 18650/05, 2 February 2016.............................................................no. 193
Süleyman Çelebi and Others v. Turkey, 37273/10 et al., 24 May 2016..............................no. 196

Decisions
Ahunbay and Others v. Turkey, Austria and Germany (dec.), 6080/06, 21 June 2016......no. 198
Sakkal and Fares v. Turkey (dec.), 52902/15, 7 June 2016..............................................no. 197
Zihni v. Turkey (dec.), 59061/16, 29 November 2016.....................................................no. 202

Communicated cases
Yavuzel and Others v. Turkey (dec.), 5317/16 et al., 6 December 2016..............................no. 202

Ukraine

Judgments
Chernetskiy v. Ukraine, 44316/07, 8 December 2016......................................................no. 202
Ignatov v. Ukraine, 40583/15, 15 December 2016......................................................no. 202
Irina Smirnova v. Ukraine, 1870/05, 13 October 2016..................................................no. 200
Karpylenko v. Ukraine, 15509/12, 11 February 2016..................................................no. 193
Korneykova and Korneykov v. Ukraine, 56660/12, 24 March 2016.............................no. 194
Mikhno v. Ukraine, 32514/12, 1 September 2016........................................................no. 199
Ruban v. Ukraine, 8927/11, 12 July 2016..............................................................no. 198

Decisions
Lisnyy and Others v. Ukraine and Russia (dec.), 5355/15, 5 July 2016.............................no. 198
Communicated cases

Ioppa v. Ukraine, 73776/14 ................................................................. no. 198
L.M.P. and V.V.P. v. Ukraine and Russia, 45742/15 ........................................ no. 198
O.I.Z. and V.P.Z. v. Ukraine and Russia, 22980/16........................................... no. 198

United Kingdom

Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

Armani Da Silva v. the United Kingdom [GC], 5878/08, 30 March 2016 ...................... no. 194
Ibrahim and Others v. the United Kingdom [GC], 50541/08 et al., 13 September 2016 .... no. 199

Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

Harkins v. the United Kingdom, 71537/14 (relinquishment) ............................................. no. 198

Judgments

British Gurkha Welfare Society and Others v. the United Kingdom, 44818/11, 15 September 2016................................. no. 199
Dallas v. the United Kingdom, 38395/12, 11 February 2016...................................... no. 193
J.N. v. the United Kingdom, 37289/12, 19 May 2016.................................................. no. 196

Decisions

C.P. v. the United Kingdom (dec.), 300/11, 6 September 2016 ...................................... no. 199
Unite the Union v. the United Kingdom (dec.), 65397/13, 3 May 2016........................ no. 196

Communicated cases

Ireland v. the United Kingdom, 5310/71............................................................................... no. 194
**CASES LISTED ALPHABETICALLY BY APPLICANT**

### A

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Reference</th>
<th>No.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>A and B v. Norway [GC]</strong>, 24130/11 and 29758/11, 15 November 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>A.B. and Others v. France</strong>, 11593/12, 12 July 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>A.M. v. France</strong>, 56324/13, 12 July 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>A.M. v. the Netherlands</strong>, 29094/09, 5 July 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>A.M. and Others v. France</strong>, 24587/12, 12 July 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>A.N. v. Lithuania</strong>, 17280/08, 31 May 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ahunbay and Others v. Turkey, Austria and Germany (dec.), 6080/06, 21 June 2016</strong></td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Al-Dulimi and Montana Management Inc. v. Switzerland [GC]</strong>, 5809/08, 21 June 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Aldeguer Tomás v. Spain</strong>, 35214/09, 14 June 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Anastasov and Others v. Slovenia (dec.), 65020/13, 18 October 2016</strong></td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Anchev v. Bulgaria</strong>, 38334/08 (communicated case)</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Arlewin v. Sweden</strong>, 22302/10, 1 March 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Armani Da Silva v. the United Kingdom [GC]</strong>, 5878/08, 30 March 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Association for Solidarity with Jehovah’s Witnesses and Others v. Turkey</strong>, 36915/10 and 8606/13, 24 May 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Avotiņš v. Latvia [GC]</strong>, 17502/07, 23 May 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Aydoğdu v. Turkey</strong>, 40448/06, 30 August 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### B

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Reference</th>
<th>No.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>B.A.C. v. Greece</strong>, 11981/15, 13 October 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bagdonavicius and Others v. Russia</strong>, 19841/06, 11 October 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Baka v. Hungary [GC]</strong>, 20261/12, 23 June 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bărbulescu v. Romania</strong>, 61496/08 (Chamber judgment of 12 January 2016 – referral)</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>197 and 192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Beausoleil v. France</strong>, 63979/11, 6 October 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bédat v. Switzerland [GC]</strong>, 56925/08, 29 March 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Béláné Nagy v. Hungary [GC]</strong>, 53080/13, 13 December 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bergmann v. Germany</strong>, 23279/14, 7 January 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Biao v. Denmark [GC]</strong>, 38590/10, 24 May 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Biržietis v. Lithuania</strong>, 49304/09, 14 June 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Blokhin v. Russia [GC]</strong>, 47152/06, 23 March 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Boacă and Others v. Romania</strong>, 40355/11, 12 January 2016</td>
<td>........................................................................................................</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case Title</td>
<td>Reference</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Borg v. Malta, 37537/13, 12 January 2016</td>
<td>no. 192</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brambilla and Others v. Italy, 22567/09, 23 June 2016</td>
<td>no. 197</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>British Gurkha Welfare Society and Others v. the United Kingdom, 44818/11, 15 September 2016</td>
<td>no. 199</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulgarıan Helsinki Committee v. Bulgaria (dec.), 35653/12 and 66172/12, 28 June 2016</td>
<td>no. 198</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buzadji v. the Republic of Moldova [GC], 23755/07, 5 July 2016</td>
<td>no. 198</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.P. v. the United Kingdom (dec.), 300/11, 6 September 2016</td>
<td>no. 199</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Çam v. Turkey, 51500/08, 23 February 2016</td>
<td>no. 193</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cangöz and Others v. Turkey, 7469/06, 26 April 2016</td>
<td>no. 195</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cătălin Eugen Micu v. Romania, 55104/13, 5 January 2016</td>
<td>no. 192</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cavit Tinarioğlu v. Turkey, 3648/04, 2 February 2016</td>
<td>no. 193</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cazan v. Romania, 30050/12, 5 April 2016</td>
<td>no. 195</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cevat Özel v. Turkey, 19602/06, 7 June 2016</td>
<td>no. 197</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cevrioğlu v. Turkey, 69546/12, 4 October 2016</td>
<td>no. 200</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chernenetskij v. Ukraine, 44316/07, 8 December 2016</td>
<td>no. 202</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cindrić and Bešić v. Croatia, 72152/13, 6 September 2016</td>
<td>no. 199</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civek v. Turkey, 55354/11, 23 February 2016</td>
<td>no. 193</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constantinides v. Greece, 76438/12, 6 October 2016</td>
<td>no. 200</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Correia de Matos v. Portugal, 56402/12 (relinquishment)</td>
<td>no. 199</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumhuriyet Halk Partisi v. Turkey, 19920/13, 26 April 2016</td>
<td>no. 195</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.L. v. Bulgaria, 7472/14, 19 May 2016</td>
<td>no. 196</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dallas v. the United Kingdom, 38395/12, 11 February 2016</td>
<td>no. 193</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>De Carolis and France Télévisions v. France, 29313/10, 21 January 2016</td>
<td>no. 192</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Di Trizio v. Switzerland, 7186/09, 2 February 2016</td>
<td>no. 193</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dökmeci v. Turkey, 74155/14, 6 December 2016</td>
<td>no. 202</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dubská and Krejzová v. the Czech Republic [GC], 28859/11 and 28473/12, 15 November 2016</td>
<td>no. 201</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Džinić v. Croatia, 38359/13, 17 May 2016</td>
<td>no. 196</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enver Aydemir v. Turkey, 26012/11, 7 June 2016</td>
<td>no. 197</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erdener v. Turkey, 23497/05, 2 February 2016</td>
<td>no. 193</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erdtmann v. Germany (dec.), 56328/10, 5 January 2016</td>
<td>no. 192</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Index 2016 to the Information Notes on the Court’s case-law

- F -

F.G. v. Sweden [GC], 43611/11, 23 March 2016 ........................................................................................................no. 194
Fábián v. Hungary, 78117/13 (Chamber judgment of 15 December 2015 – referral) ..................................................no. 196
Findikoglu v. Germany (dec.), 20672/15, 7 June 2016 ......................................................................................no. 197
Fourkiotis v. Greece, 74758/11, 16 June 2016 ......................................................................................................no. 197
Frumkin v. Russia, 74568/12, 5 January 2016 .................................................................................................no. 192

- G -

Gankin and Others v. Russia, 2430/06 et al., 31 May 2016.................................................................no. 196
Garib v. the Netherlands, 43494/09 (Chamber judgment of 23 February 2016 – referral) ..................no. 193 and no. 199
Geotech Kancev GmbH v. Germany, 23646/09, 2 June 2016 ........................................................................no. 197
Gerovska Popčevska v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 48783/07, 7 January 2016 .......................................................................................................................no. 192
Görmüş and Others v. Turkey, 49085/07, 19 January 2016 ........................................................................no. 192
Gouarré Patte v. Andorra, 33427/10, 12 January 2016 ..................................................................................no. 192
Grebneva and Alisimchik v. Russia, 8918/05, 22 November 2016 .........................................................no. 201
Greek-Catholic Parish of Lupeni and Others v. Romania [GC], 76943/11, 29 November 2016 .........................no. 201
Gaberina v. Croatia, 23682/13, 22 March 2016 ............................................................................................no. 194
Gülcü v. Turkey, 17526/10, 19 January 2016 ..........................................................................................no. 192

- H -

Halime Kılıç v. Turkey, 63034/11, 28 June 2016 ..............................................................................................no. 198
Harkins v. the United Kingdom, 71537/14 (relinquishment) ........................................................................no. 198
Huseynli and Others v. Azerbaijan, 67360/11, 67964/11 and 69379/11, 11 February 2016 .........................no. 193

- I -

Ibrahim and Others v. the United Kingdom [GC], 50541/08 et al., 13 September 2016 ......................no. 199
Ignatov v. Ukraine, 40583/15, 15 December 2016 .......................................................................................no. 202
Igor Pascari v. the Republic of Moldova, 25555/10, 30 August 2016 ..................................................no. 199
Ioan Pop and Others v. Romania, 52924/09, 6 December 2016 ..................................................................no. 202
Ioppa v. Ukraine, 73776/14 (communicated case) ...................................................................................no. 198
Irina Smirnova v. Ukraine, 1870/05, 13 October 2016 ..............................................................................no. 200
Ireland v. the United Kingdom, 5310/71 (communicated case) ..................................................................no. 194
Ivanova and Cherkezov v. Bulgaria, 46577/15, 21 April 2016 .................................................................no. 195
Ivanovski v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 29908/11, 21 January 2016 .........................no. 192
İzzeütin Doğan and Others v. Turkey [GC], 62649/10, 26 April 2016 .......................................................no. 195
Index 2016 to the Information Notes on the Court’s case-law

- J -

J.K. and Others v. Sweden [GC], 59166/12, 23 August 2016 ........................................................... no. 199
J.N. v. the United Kingdom, 37289/12, 19 May 2016 ................................................................. no. 196
Jakeljić v. Croatia, 22768/12 (Chamber judgment of 28 June 2016 – referral) ............................... no. 201
Jakšovski and Trifunovski v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 56381/09 and 58738/09, 7 January 2016 ............................................................... no. 192
Jeronović v. Latvia [GC], 44898/10, 5 July 2016 ........................................................................ no. 198
Jørgensen and Others v. Denmark (dec.), 30173/12, 28 June 2016 .............................................. no. 199

- K -

K.J. v. Poland, 30813/14, 1 March 2016 ....................................................................................... no. 194
K.S. and M.S. v. Germany, 33696/11, 6 October 2016 ............................................................... no. 200
Kahn v. Germany, 16313/10, 17 March 2016 ........................................................................ no. 194
Kalda v. Estonia, 17429/10, 19 January 2016 ........................................................................ no. 192
Kaas GL v. Turkey, 4982/07, 22 November 2016 ....................................................................... no. 201
Kanaginis v. Greece, 27662/09, 27 October 2016 ................................................................ no. 200
Karabeyoğlu v. Turkey, 30083/10, 7 June 2016 ........................................................................ no. 197
Karácsony and Others v. Hungary [GC], 42461/13 and 44357/13, 17 May 2016 ................ no. 196
Karapetyan and Others v. Armenia, 59001/08, 17 November 2016 ........................................ no. 201
Karelin v. Russia, 926/08, 20 September 2016 ................................................................. no. 199
Károly Nagy v. Hungary, 56665/09 (Chamber judgment of 1 December 2015 – referral) .... no. 196
Karpyleenko v. Ukraine, 15509/12, 11 February 2016 ............................................................... no. 193
Kashlan v. Russia (dec.), 60189/15, 19 April 2016 ................................................................ no. 196
Kashlev v. Estonia, 22574/08, 26 April 2016 ......................................................................... no. 195
Kasparov v. Russia, 53659/07, 11 October 2016 ................................................................... no. 200
Keriman Tekin and Others v. Turkey, 22035/10, 15 November 2016 .................................... no. 201
Kerman v. Turkey, 35132/05, 22 November 2016 ................................................................ no. 201
Khan v. Germany [GC], 38030/12, 21 September 2016 ....................................................... no. 199
Khaletia and Others v. Italy, 16483/12 (Chamber judgment of 1 September 2015 – referral) ... no. 193
Khaletia and Others v. Italy [GC], 16483/12, 15 December 2016 ........................................ no. 202
Kiril Zlatkov Nikolov v. France, 70474/11 and 68038/12, 10 November 2016 .............. no. 201
Kitanovska Stanojkovic and Others v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 2319/14, 13 October 2016 ............................................................... no. 200
Kocherov and Sergeyeva v. Russia, 16899/13, 29 March 2016 ........................................ no. 194
Kolesnikovich v. Russia, 44694/13, 22 March 2016 ........................................................ no. 194
Kolonja v. Greece, 49441/12, 19 May 2016 ......................................................................... no. 196
Korneykova and Korneykov v. Ukraine, 56660/12, 24 March 2016 ...................................... no. 194

58
Kotilainen and Others v. Finland, 62439/12 (communicated case) .............................................. no. 192
Kutlu and Others v. Turkey, 51861/11, 13 December 2016 ........................................................ no. 202

- L -
L.D. and P.K. v. Bulgaria, 7949/11 and 45522/13, 8 December 2016 ....................................... no. 202
L.E. v. Greece, 71545/12, 21 January 2016 ............................................................................. no. 192
L.M.P. and V.V.P. v. Ukraine and Russia, 45742/15 (communicated case) .............................. no. 198
Lazu v. the Republic of Moldova, 46182/08, 5 July 2016 ........................................................ no. 198
Les Authentiks and Supras Auteuil 91 v. France, 4696/11 and 4703/11, 27 October 2016...... no. 200
Lhermitte v. Belgium [GC], 34238/09, 29 November 2016 ...................................................... no. 201
Lisnyy and Others v. Ukraine and Russia (dec.), 5355/15, 5 July 2016 ................................ no. 198
Lopes de Sousa Fernandes v. Portugal, 56080/13 (Chamber judgment of 15 December 2015
– referral) ......................................................................................................................... no. 196
Lukats v. Romania, 24199/07, 5 April 2016 ........................................................................... no. 195

- M -
M.C. and A.C. v. Romania, 12060/12, 12 April 2016 ............................................................... no. 195
M.G. v. Turkey, 646/10, 22 March 2016 ................................................................................ no. 194
Magyar Helsinki Bizottság v. Hungary [GC], 18030/11, 8 November 2016 ............................ no. 201
Magyar Tartalomszolgáltatók Egyesülete and Index.hu Zrt v. Hungary, 22947/13,
2 February 2016 ................................................................................................................ no. 193
Makuchyan and Minasyan v. Azerbaijan and Hungary, 17247/13 (communicated case) .... no. 193
Mamatas and Others v. Greece, 63066/14, 64297/14 and 66106/14, 21 July 2016 ............... no. 198
Mandet v. France, 30955/12, 14 January 2016 .................................................................... no. 192
Marc Brauer v. Germany, 24062/13, 1 September 2016 ........................................................ no. 199
Mauriello v. Italy (dec.), 14862/07, 13 September 2016 .......................................................... no. 200
Medžlis Islamske Zajednice Brčko and Others v. Bosnia and Herzegovina, 17224/11
(Chamber judgment of 13 October 2015 – referral) ............................................................. no. 194
Meier v. Switzerland, 10109/14, 9 February 2016 ................................................................. no. 193
Merabishvili v. Georgia, 72508/13 (Chamber judgment of 14 June 2016 – referral) ......... no. 197 and no. 200
Mikhno v. Ukraine, 32514/12, 1 September 2016 ................................................................. no. 199
Mitrov v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 45959/09, 2 June 2016 ................. no. 197
Mitrova and Savik v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, 42534/09,
11 February 2016 ................................................................................................................ no. 193
Moreira Ferreira v. Portugal (no 2.), 19867/12 (relinquishment) ......................................... no. 192
Mozer v. the Republic of Moldova and Russia [GC], 11138/10, 23 February 2016 .............. no. 193
Mučibabić v. Serbia, 34661/07, 12 July 2016 ...................................................................... no. 198
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>No.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Murray v. the Netherlands [GC], 10511/10, 26 April 2016</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muršić v. Croatia [GC], 7334/13, 20 October 2016</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N.Ts. and Others v. Georgia, 71776/12, 2 February 2016</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nagmetov v. Russia, 35589/08 (Chamber judgment of 5 November 2015 – referral)</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Naït-Liman v. Switzerland, 51357/07 (Chamber judgment of 21 June 2016 – referral)</td>
<td>197 and 201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Naku v. Lithuania and Sweden, 26126/07, 8 November 2016</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nasr and Ghali v. Italy, 44883/09, 23 February 2016</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Navalnyy and Ofitserov v. Russia, 46632/13 and 28671/14, 23 February 2016</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Novikova and Others v. Russia, 25501/07 et al., 26 April 2016</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Novruk and Others v. Russia, 31039/11 et al., 15 March 2016</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O.I.Z. and V.P.Z. v. Ukraine and Russia, 22980/16 (communicated case)</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Olivieri and Others v. Italy, 17708/12 et al., 25 February 2016</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Öztünç v. Turkey, 14777/08, 9 February 2016</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paić v. Croatia, 47082/12, 29 March 2016</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pajić v. Croatia, 68453/13, 23 February 2016</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Palmén v. Sweden (dec.), 38292/15, 22 March 2016</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Papaioannou v. Greece, 18880/15, 2 June 2016</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Papavasilakis v. Greece, 66899/14, 15 September 2016</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paposhvili v. Greece, 41738/10, 13 December 2016</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partei Die Friesen v. Germany, 65480/10, 28 January 2016</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Party for a Democratic Society (DTP) and Others v. Turkey, 3840/10 et al., 12 January 2016</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petschulies v. Germany, 6281/13, 2 June 2016</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippou v. Cyprus, 71148/10, 14 June 2016</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pilav v. Bosnia and Herzegovina, 41939/07, 9 June 2016</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pinto Coelho v. Portugal (no. 2), 48718/11, 22 March 2016</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pönkä v. Estonia, 64160/11, 8 November 2016</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R.B. v. Hungary, 64602/12, 12 April 2016</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R.C. and V.C. v. France, 76491/14, 12 July 2016</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
R.K. and Others v. France, 68264/14, 12 July 2016 ................................................................. no. 198
R.M. and Others v. France, 33201/11, 12 July 2016 ................................................................. no. 198
Radi and Gherghina v. Romania (dec.), 34655/14, 5 January 2016 .................................. no. 192
Radomila and Others v. Croatia, 37685/10 (Chamber judgment of 28 June 2016 – referral) no. 201
Ramadan v. Malta, 76136/12, 21 June 2016 ........................................................................... no. 197
Ramos Nunes de Carvalho e Sá v. Portugal, 55391/13, 57728/13 and 74041/13 (Chamber judgment of 21 June 2016 – referral) .................................................. no. 200
Rasul Jafarov v. Azerbaijan, 69981/14, 17 March 2016 ......................................................... no. 194
Regner v. the Czech Republic, 35289/11 (Chamber judgment of 26 November 2015 – referral) ........................................... no. 196
Reisner v. Turkey (just satisfaction), 46815/09, 1 December 2016 .................................... no. 202
Ruban v. Ukraine, 8927/11, 12 July 2016 ............................................................................. no. 198
Rywin v. Poland, 6091/06, 4047/07 and 4070/07, 18 February 2016 .................................. no. 193

- S -

Şahin Kuş v. Turkey, 33160/04, 7 June 2016 ........................................................................ no. 197
Sakhanov v. Russia (dec.), 16559/16, 18 October 2016 ....................................................... no. 201
Sakir v. Greece, 48475/09, 24 March 2016 ............................................................................. no. 194
Sakkal and Fares v. Turkey (dec.), 52902/15, 7 June 2016 ................................................... no. 197
Saliba v. Malta, 24221/13, 29 November 2016 ...................................................................... no. 201
Salihu and Others v. Sweden (dec.), 33628/15, 10 May 2016 .............................................. no. 196
Semir Güzel v. Turkey, 29483/09, 13 September 2016 ......................................................... no. 199
SIA AKKA/LAA v. Latvia, 562/05, 12 July 2016 ................................................................. no. 198
Simeonovi v. Bulgaria, 21980/04 (Chamber judgment of 20 October 2015 – referral) ...... no. 194
Soares de Melo v. Portugal, 72850/14, 16 February 2016 .................................................... no. 193
Société Oxygène Plus v. France (dec.), 76959/11, 17 May 2016 ........................................... no. 197
Sodan v. Turkey, 18650/05, 2 February 2016 ........................................................................ no. 193
Sousa Goucha v. Portugal, 70434/12, 22 March 2016 ......................................................... no. 194
Strack and Richter v. Germany (dec.), 28811/12 and 50303/12, 5 July 2016 ...................... no. 199
Süleyman Çelebi and Others v. Turkey, 37273/10 et al., 24 May 2016 ............................... no. 196
Süveges v. Hungary, 50255/12, 5 January 2016 ................................................................. no. 192
Szabó and Vissz v. Hungary, 37138/14, 12 January 2016 ..................................................... no. 192

- T -

T.P. and A.T v. Hungary, 37871/14 and 73986/14, 4 October 2016 ........................................ no. 200
Tabbane v. Switzerland (dec.), 41069/12, 1 March 2016 ....................................................... no. 194
Index 2016 to the Information Notes on the Court’s case-law

Taddeucci and McCall v. Italy, 51362/09, 30 June 2016 .............................................................. no. 197

Telegraaf Media Nederland Landelijke Media B.V. and van der Graaf v. the Netherlands (dec.), 33847/11, 30 August 2016 .............................................................. no. 199

Topekhin v. Russia, 78774/13, 10 May 2016 .............................................................................. no. 196

Trapeznikov and Others v. Russia, 5623/09 et al., 5 April 2016 ................................................... no. 195

Travaš v. Croatia, 75581/13, 4 October 2016 ............................................................................... no. 200

Trevisanato v. Italy, 32610/07, 15 September 2016 .................................................................... no. 199

- U -

Unite the Union v. the United Kingdom (dec.), 65397/13, 3 May 2016 ........................................ no. 196

Uspaskich v. Lithuania, 14737/08, 20 December 2016 ............................................................... no. 202

- V -

V.M. and Others v. Belgium [GC], 60125/11, 17 November 2016 ................................................ no. 201

Vardanyan and Nanushyan v. Armenia, 8001/07, 27 October 2016 ............................................. no. 200

Versini-Campinchi and Crasnianski v. France, 49176/11, 16 June 2016 ...................................... no. 197

Vukota-Bojić v. Switzerland, 61838/10, 18 October 2016 ............................................................ no. 200

- W -

W.D v. Belgium, 73548/13, 6 September 2016 ......................................................................... no. 199

Wenner v. Germany, 62303/13, 1 September 2016 ................................................................. no. 199

- Y -

Yaroslav Belousov v. Russia, 2653/13 and 60980/14, 4 October 2016 ........................................ no. 200

Yavuzel and Others v. Turkey (dec.), 5317/16 et al., 6 December 2016 (communicated case) ...... no. 202

Yevdokimov and Others v. Russia, 27236/05 et al., 16 February 2016 ........................................ no. 193

- Z -

Žaja v. Croatia, 37462/09, 4 October 2016 ................................................................................ no. 200

Zherebin v. Russia, 51445/09, 24 March 2016 ......................................................................... no. 194

Ziemiński v. Poland (no. 2), 1799/07, 5 July 2016 .................................................................... no. 198

Zihni v. Turkey (dec.), 59061/16, 29 November 2016 ............................................................... no. 202
DECISIONS OF OTHER INTERNATIONAL JURISDICTIONS

**Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU)**

_Aleksei Petruhhin, C-182/15, 6 September 2016_ no. 199  
Assessment of risk of inhuman or degrading treatment where non-EU State requests extradition of EU citizen

_David L. Parris v. Trinity College Dublin e.a., C-443/15, 24 November 2016_ no. 201  
Partner of retired employee not entitled to survivor’s benefits where domestic law did not allow civil partnerships for same-sex couples at relevant time: no discrimination found

_J.N. v. Staatssecretaris van Veiligheid en Justitie, C-601/15 PPU, 15 February 2016_ no. 193  
Detention of asylum-seeker on grounds of national security or public order

_JZ v. Prokuratura Rejonowa Łódź–Śródmieście, C-294/16 PPU, 28 July 2016_ no. 198  
No deprivation of liberty for a nine hour overnight daily curfew monitored by means of an electronic tag

_Maria do Céu Bragança Linares Verruga and Others v. Ministre de l'Enseignement supérieur et de la Recherche, C-238/15, 14 December 2016_ no. 202  
Eligibility of non-resident students for financial aid dependent on parent’s having worked in aid-providing member State for a continuous period of at least five years

_Nabiel Peter Bogendorff von Wolffersdorff v. Standesamt der Stadt Karlsruhe and Zentraler Juristischer Dienst der Stadt Karlsruhe, C-438/14, 2 June 2016_ no. 197  
Refusal to recognise name indicative of noble origins chosen in another Member State for personal reasons

_Pál Aranyosi and Robert Căldăraru, joined cases C-404/15 and C-659/15 PPU, 5 April 2016_ no. 195  
Procedure for dealing with execution of European Arrest Warrant in case of actual risk of inhuman or degrading conditions of detention in issuing State

_Piotr Kossowski, C-486/14, 29 June 2016_ no. 197  
Fresh proceedings may be brought against a suspect in a Schengen State where previous criminal proceedings in another Schengen State were terminated without a detailed investigation

_Tele2 Sverige AB v Post- och telestyrelsen and Secretary of State for the Home Department v. Tom Watson and Others, C-203/15 and C-698/15, 21 December 2016_ no. 202  
Incompatibility with EU law of national legislation imposing general obligation on providers of electronic communications services to retain data
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Title</th>
<th>Series C No.</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>No.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chinchilla Sandoval v. Guatemala, Series C No. 312, 29 February 2016</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>no. 201</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right to life and personal integrity of prisoners</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Duque v. Colombia, Series C No. 310, 26 February 2016</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>no. 199</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality before the law and non-discrimination in the access to a pension</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>for same-sex couples</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Flor Freire v. Ecuador, Series C No. 315, 31 August 2016</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>no. 202</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discrimination based on perceived sexual orientation in military disciplinary proceedings</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gonzales Lluy et al v. Ecuador, Series C No. 298, 1 September 2015</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>no. 192</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rights to life, personal integrity, education and non-discrimination of a child living with HIV</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Case of Kaliña and Lokono Peoples v. Suriname, Series C No. 309, 23 November 2015</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>no. 198</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protection of the environment and natural resources vis-à-vis the rights of indigenous peoples</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>López Lone et al. v. Honduras, Series C No. 302, 5 October 2015</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>no. 193</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rights of judges vis-à-vis their removal or dismissal for actions against a coup d'état</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Maldonado Ordoñez v. Guatemala, Series C No. 311, 3 May 2016</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>no. 200</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fair trial guarantees in disciplinary proceedings</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Punta Piedra Garifuna Community v. Honduras, Series C No. 304, 8 October 2015</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>no. 195</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obligation to guarantee the effective use and enjoyment of the collective territory of indigenous and tribal Peoples through title clearing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Quispialuya Vilcapoma v. Peru, Series C No. 308, 23 November 2015</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>no. 197</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ill-treatment during military service and ineffective investigation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ruano Torres et al. v. El Salvador, Series C No. 303, 5 October 2015</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>no. 194</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presumption of innocence and defence through public legal counsel</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Velásquez Paiz et al. v. Guatemala, Series C No. 307, 19 November 2015</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>no. 196</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duty to protect with strict due diligence in cases of violence against women</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>