



## List of cases selected for publication in *Reports of Judgments and Decisions 2017*<sup>1</sup>

[Update: février 2018]

### Notes on citation:

Cases are listed alphabetically by applicant and by respondent State.

By default, all references are to Chamber judgments. Grand Chamber cases, whether judgments or decisions, are indicated by "[GC]". Decisions are indicated by "(dec.)".

Chamber judgments that are not yet "final" within the meaning of Article 44 of the Convention<sup>2</sup> are marked "(not final)". In the event that any such judgment is accepted for referral to the Grand Chamber in accordance with Article 43,<sup>3</sup> it will not be published in the *Reports of Judgments and Decisions 2017*, but will be replaced by a judgment or decision from the "Reserve list".

The volume composition for the years 2017 has not yet been determined. Until further notice, cases of 2017 may be cited simply by indicating the year of publication e.g. ECHR 2017, without adding a volume number. For further information on the manner of citing the Court's case-law, please see [here](#).

The Court reserves the right to report some or all of the judgments and decisions listed below in the form of extracts. The full original language version or versions of any such judgment or decision will remain available for consultation in the HUDOC database.

\* \* \*

### Table of contents

I. Cases listed alphabetically by applicant.....	2
II. Cases listed alphabetically by respondent State .....	11

---

<sup>1</sup> List approved by the Bureau following recommendation by the Court's Jurisconsult.

<sup>2</sup> Article 44 § 2 of the Convention provides:

"The judgment of a Chamber shall become final

(a) when the parties declare that they will not request that the case be referred to the Grand Chamber; or

(b) three months after the date of the judgment, if reference of the case to the Grand Chamber has not been requested; or

(c) when the panel of the Grand Chamber rejects the request to refer under Article 43."

<sup>3</sup> Article 43 of the Convention provides:

"1. Within a period of three months from the date of the judgment of the Chamber, any party to the case may, in exceptional cases, request that the case be referred to the Grand Chamber.

2. A panel of five judges of the Grand Chamber shall accept the request if the case raises a serious question affecting the interpretation or application of the Convention or the Protocols thereto, or a serious issue of general importance.

3. If the panel accepts the request, the Grand Chamber shall decide the case by means of a judgment."

## I. Cases listed alphabetically by applicant

---

### A

6.4.2017

#### [\*\*A.P., Garçon and Nicot v. France, nos. 79885/12 and 2 others\*\*](#)

##### **ARTICLE 8**

Respect for private life  
Positive obligations

Legal requirements for rectification of civil status for transgender persons: *violation; no violations*

12.10.2017

#### [\*\*Adyan and Others v. Armenia, no. 75604/11\*\*](#)

##### **ARTICLE 9**

Freedom of conscience, freedom of religion, manifest religion or belief

Conviction of conscientious objectors for refusing to perform military or alternative service: *violation*

### B

5.9.2017

#### [\*\*Bărbulescu v. Romania \[GC\], no. 61496/08\*\*](#)

##### **ARTICLE 8**

Respect for private life  
Respect for correspondence

Monitoring of an employee's use of the Internet at his place of work and use of data collected to justify his dismissal: *violation*

20.6.2017

#### [\*\*Bayev and Others v. Russia, nos. 67667/09 and 2 others\*\*](#)

##### **ARTICLE 10**

Freedom of expression

Legislative prohibition on the promotion of homosexuality among minors reinforcing stigma and prejudice and encouraging homophobia: *violation*

##### **ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination (Article 10)

Unjustified difference in treatment between heterosexual majority and homosexual minority: *violation*

5.10.2017

[Becker v. Norway, no. 21272/12](#)

**ARTICLE 10**

Freedom to receive information, freedom to impart information

Journalist compelled to give evidence against source who had already come forward: *violation*

12.10.2017

[Burmych and Others v. Ukraine \[GC\], nos. 46852/13 et al.](#)

**ARTICLE 37**

Striking out applications

Continued examination of cases originating in systemic problem identified in *Yuriy Nikolayevich Ivanov v. Ukraine: struck out*

**ARTICLE 46**

Pilot judgment pilote

Division of responsibility between the Court and the Committee of Ministers following failure to execute a pilot judgment

C

25.7.2017

[Carvalho Pinto de Sousa Morais v. Portugal, no. 17484/15](#)

**ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination (Article 8)

Reduction in damages award on grounds of sex and age of claimant: *violation*

30.03.2017

[Chowdury and Others v. Greece, no. 21884/15](#)

**ARTICLE 4**

Trafficking in human beings, forced labour, positive obligations

Inadequate response to human-trafficking through exploitation of vulnerability of unauthorised migrant workers: *violation*

## D

30.5.2017

### [Davydov and Others v. Russia, no. 75947/11](#)

#### **ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 1**

Free expression of the opinion of the people

Failure by domestic authorities to adequately investigate complaints of serious electoral irregularities: *violation*

23.2.2017

### [De Tommaso v. Italy \[GC\], no. 43395/09](#)

#### **ARTICLE 5**

##### **Article 5 § 1**

Deprivation of liberty

Imposition of preventive measures entailing restrictions on freedom of movement on individual considered to be a danger to society: *Article 5 not applicable*

##### **Article 6 § 1 (civil)**

Civil rights and obligations

Public hearing

Imposition of preventive measures without public hearing: *Article 6 applicable; violation*

#### **ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 4**

##### **Article 2 § 1**

Freedom of movement

Lack of clarity of Italian legislation regarding imposition of "special police supervision" orders on persons considered a danger to society: *violation*

## F

5.9.2017

### [Fábián v. Hungary \[GC\], no. 78117/13](#)

#### **ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination (Article 1 of Protocol No.1)

Difference in entitlement to continued payment of State pension for pensioners employed in civil service and pensioners employed in private sector: *no violation*

#### **ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1**

Peaceful enjoyment of possessions

Suspension of State pension for pensioner employed in the civil service: *no violation*

## G

6.11.2017

[\*\*Garib v. Netherlands \[GC\], no. 43494/09\*\*](#)

**ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 4**

**Article 2 § 1**

Freedom to choose residence

Policy imposing length-of-residence and type of income conditions on persons wishing to settle in inner-city area of Rotterdam: *no violation*

## H

5.12.2017

[\*\*Hamidovic v. Bosnia and Herzegovina, no. 57792/15\*\*](#)

**ARTICLE 9**

Freedom of conscience, freedom of religion, manifest religion or belief

Punishment of witness for refusing to comply with court order to remove skullcap when giving evidence: violation

15.6.2017

[\*\*Harkins v. the United Kingdom \(dec.\) \[GC\], no. 71537/14\*\*](#)

**ARTICLE 35**

**Article 35 § 2 (b)**

Matter already examined by the Court

Development in Court's jurisprudence did not constitute "relevant new information" for purposes of Article 35 § 2 (b): *inadmissible*

17.1.2017

[\*\*Hutchinson v. the United Kingdom \[GC\], no. 57592/08\*\*](#)

**ARTICLE 3**

Inhuman or degrading punishment

Continued detention under whole life order following clarification of Secretary of State's powers to order release: *no violation*

## J

17.1.2017

[J. and Others v. Austria, no. 58216/12](#)

**ARTICLE 4**

**Article 4 § 1**

Trafficking in human beings, positive obligations

Decision of prosecutor not to pursue investigation into alleged human trafficking offences committed abroad by non-nationals: *no violation*

## K

14.9.2017

[Károly Nagy v. Hungary \[GC\], no. 56665/09](#)

**ARTICLE 6**

**Article 6 § 1 (civil)**

Access to court

Supreme Court ruling that civil courts had no jurisdiction to hear pastor's claim for wrongful dismissal by church: *Article 6 not applicable; inadmissible*

24.1.2017

[Khamtokhu and Aksenchik v. Russia \[GC\], nos. 60367/08 and 961/11](#)

**ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination (Article 5)

Alleged discrimination in provisions governing liability to life imprisonment: *no violations*

## L

19.12.2017

[Lopes de Sousa Fernandes v. Portugal \[GC\], no. 56080/13](#)

**ARTICLE 2**

Positive obligations

Alleged medical negligence resulting in patient's death: *no violation*

Failure to conduct adequate and timely inquiry into death resulting from suspected medical negligence: *violation*

## M

25.7.2017

### [M v. the Netherlands, no. 2156/10](#)

#### **ARTICLE 6**

##### **Article 6 § 3 (b)**

Access to relevant files

Restrictions on defence access to classified information: *no violation*

##### **Article 6 § 3 (c)**

Defence through legal assistance

Restrictions on divulgence by accused of classified information to his defence counsel: *violation*

##### **Article 6 § 3 (d)**

Examination of witnesses

Restrictions on access to classified information defence wished to use to examine witnesses: *no violation*

27.6.2017

### [Medžlis Islamske Zajednice Brčko and Others v. Bosnia and Herzegovina \[GC\], no. 17224/11](#)

#### **ARTICLE 10**

Freedom of expression

NGOs bound by requirement to verify factual statements defamatory of private individuals: *no violation*

28.11.2017

### [Merabishvili v. Georgia \[GC\], no. 72508/13](#)

#### **ARTICLE 18**

Restriction for unauthorised purposes

Extension of leader of opposition's pre-trial detention with primary purpose of obtaining information on matters unrelated to suspected offence: *violation*

13.6.2017

### [Moohan and Gillon v. the United Kingdom \(dec.\), nos. 22962/15 and 23345/15](#)

#### **ARTICLE 35**

##### **Article 35 § 3 (a)**

Competence *ratione materiae*

Referendum on Scottish Independence did not fall within scope of Article 3 of Protocol No. 1: *inadmissible*

11.7.2017

[Moreira Ferreira v. Portugal \(no. 2\) \[GC\], no. 19867/12](#)

**ARTICLE 6**

**Article 6 § 1 (Criminal)**

Criminal charge  
Access to court  
Fair hearing

Complaint about refusal by domestic court to re-open criminal proceedings following finding of a violation of Article 6 by European Court: *admissible*

Refusal by Supreme Court of request for revision of a criminal judgment further to a judgment of European Court finding a violation of Article 6: *no violation*

O

10.1.2017

[Osmanoğlu and Kocabaş v. Switzerland, no. 29086/12](#)

**ARTICLE 9**

Manifest religion or belief

Imposition of fine on parents for refusing, on religious grounds, to allow their daughters to attend compulsory mixed swimming lessons at their primary school: *no violation*

P

24.1.2017

[Paradiso and Campanelli v. Italy \[GC\], no. 25358/12](#)

**ARTICLE 8**

Respect for private life

Removal of a child born abroad as a result of a surrogacy arrangement entered into by a couple later found to have no biological link with the child: *no violation*

R

19.9.2017

[Regner v. the Czech Republic \[GC\], no. 35289/11](#)

**ARTICLE 6**

**Article 6 § 1 (administrative)**

Fair hearing  
Adversarial trial  
Equality of arms

Lack of access to classified information constituting decisive evidence in judicial-review proceedings: *Article 6 applicable; no violation*



## S

27.6.2017

[Satakunnan Markkinapörssi Oy and Satamedia Oy v. Finland \[GC\], no. 931/13](#)

**ARTICLE 10**

Freedom to impart information

Order restraining mass publication of tax information: *no violation*

12.5.2017

[Simeonovi v. Bulgaria \[GC\], no. 21980/04](#)

**ARTICLE 6**

**Article 6 § 1**

Fair hearing

**Article 6 § 3 (c)**

Defence through legal assistance

Lack of access to lawyer during first three days of police custody not affecting overall fairness of the trial: *no violation*

28.3.2017

[Škorjanec v. Croatia, no. 25536/14](#)

**ARTICLE 3**

Positive obligations (procedural aspect)

Failure to investigate racially motivated act of violence against victim by association: *violation*

## T

13.4.2017

[Tagayeva and Others v. Russia, nos. 26562/07 and 6 others](#)

**ARTICLE 2**

Use of force

Positive obligations (substantive aspect)

Effective investigation

Positive obligations (procedural aspect)

Breach of State's obligations to protect life during hostage taking crisis in Beslan in 2004 and lack of effective investigation: *violations*

**ARTICLE 13**

Effective remedy

Special importance of compensation and access to information under Article 13: *no violation*

**ARTICLE 46**

Execution of judgment – general measures  
Execution of judgment – individual measures

Respondent State to take measures to ensure adequate legal framework for use of lethal force during security operations

## II. Cases listed alphabetically by respondent State

---

### Armenia

12.10.2017

**[Adyan and Others v. Armenia, no. 75604/11](#)**

**ARTICLE 9**

Freedom of conscience, freedom of religion, manifest religion or belief

Conviction of conscientious objectors for refusing to perform military or alternative service: *violation*

### Austria

17.1.2017

**[J. and Others v. Austria, no. 58216/12](#)**

**ARTICLE 4**

**Article 4 § 1**

Trafficking in human beings, positive obligations

Decision of prosecutor not to pursue investigation into alleged human trafficking offences committed abroad by non-nationals: *no violation*

### Bosnia and Herzegovina

27.6.2017

**[Medžlis Islamske Zajednice Brčko and Others v. Bosnia and Herzegovina \[GC\], no. 17224/11](#)**

**ARTICLE 10**

Freedom of expression

NGOs bound by requirement to verify factual statements defamatory of private individuals: *no violation*

5.12.2017

**Article 9**

**[Hamidovic v. Bosnia and Herzegovina, no. 57792/15](#)**

Freedom of conscience, freedom of religion, manifest religion or belief

Punishment of witness for refusing to comply with court order to remove skullcap when giving evidence: *violation*

## Bulgaria

12.5.2017

### [Simeonovi v. Bulgaria \[GC\], no. 21980/04](#)

#### **ARTICLE 6**

##### **Article 6 § 1**

Fair hearing

##### **Article 6 § 3 (c)**

Defence through legal assistance

Lack of access to lawyer during first three days of police custody not affecting overall fairness of the trial: *no violation*

## Croatia

28.3.2017

### [Škorjanec v. Croatia, no. 25536/14](#)

#### **ARTICLE 3**

Positive obligations (procedural aspect)

Failure to investigate racially motivated act of violence against victim by association: *violation*

## Czech Republic

19.9.2017

### [Regner v. the Czech Republic \[GC\], no. 35289/11](#)

#### **ARTICLE 6**

##### **Article 6 § 1 (administrative)**

Fair hearing

Adversarial trial

Equality of arms

Lack of access to classified information constituting decisive evidence in judicial-review proceedings: *Article 6 applicable; no violation*

## Finland

27.6.2017

### [Satakunnan Markkinapörssi Oy and Satamedia Oy v. Finland \[GC\], no. 931/13](#)

#### **ARTICLE 10**

Freedom to impart information

Order restraining mass publication of tax information: *no violation*

## France

6.4.2017

### [A.P., Garçon and Nicot v. France, nos. 79885/12 and 2 others](#)

#### **ARTICLE 8**

Respect for private life  
Positive obligations

Legal requirements for rectification of civil status for transgender persons: *violation; no violations*

## Georgia

28.11.2017

### [Merabishvili v. Georgia \[GC\], no. 72508/13](#)

#### **ARTICLE 18**

Restriction for unauthorised purposes

Extension of leader of opposition's pre-trial detention with primary purpose of obtaining information on matters unrelated to suspected offence: *violation*

## Greece

30.03.2017

### [Chowdury and Others v. Greece, no. 21884/15](#)

#### **ARTICLE 4**

Trafficking in human beings, forced labour, positive obligations

Inadequate response to human-trafficking through exploitation of vulnerability of unauthorised migrant workers: *violation*

## Hungary

5.9.2017

### [Fábián v. Hungary \[GC\], no. 78117/13](#)

#### **ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination (Article 1 of Protocol No.1)

Difference in entitlement to continued payment of State pension for pensioners employed in civil service and pensioners employed in private sector: *no violation*

#### **ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1**

Peaceful enjoyment of possessions

Suspension of State pension for pensioner employed in the civil service: *no violation*

14.9.2017

[Károly Nagy v. Hungary \[GC\], no. 56665/09](#)

**ARTICLE 6**

**Article 6 § 1 (civil)**

Access to court

Supreme Court ruling that civil courts had no jurisdiction to hear pastor's claim for wrongful dismissal by church: *Article 6 not applicable; inadmissible*

Italy

24.1.2017

[Paradiso and Campanelli v. Italy \[GC\], no. 25358/12](#)

**ARTICLE 8**

Respect for private life

Removal of a child born abroad as a result of a surrogacy arrangement entered into by a couple later found to have no biological link with the child: *no violation*

23.2.2017

[De Tommaso v. Italy \[GC\], no. 43395/09](#)

**ARTICLE 5**

**Article 5 § 1**

Deprivation of liberty

Imposition of preventive measures entailing restrictions on freedom of movement on individual considered to be a danger to society: *Article 5 not applicable*

**Article 6 § 1 (civil)**

Civil rights and obligations, Public hearing

Imposition of preventive measures without public hearing: *Article 6 applicable; violation*

**ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 4**

**Article 2 § 1**

Freedom of movement

Lack of clarity of Italian legislation regarding imposition of "special police supervision" orders on persons considered a danger to society: *violation*

Netherlands

25.7.2017

[M v. the Netherlands, no. 2156/10](#)

**ARTICLE 6**

**Article 6 § 3 (b)**

Access to relevant files

Restrictions on defence access to classified information: *no violation*

**Article 6 § 3 (c)**

Defence through legal assistance

Restrictions on divulgence by accused of classified information to his defence counsel: *violation*

**Article 6 § 3 (d)**

Examination of witnesses

Restrictions on access to classified information defence wished to use to examine witnesses: *no violation*

6.11.2017

**[Garib v. Netherlands \[GC\], no. 43494/09](#)**

**ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 4**

**Article 2 § 1**

Freedom to choose residence

Policy imposing length-of-residence and type of income conditions on persons wishing to settle in inner-city area of Rotterdam: *no violation*

Norway

5.10.2017

**[Becker v. Norway, no. 21272/12](#)**

**ARTICLE 10**

Freedom to receive information, freedom to impart information

Journalist compelled to give evidence against source who had already come forward: *violation*

Portugal

11.7.2017

**[Moreira Ferreira v. Portugal \(no. 2\) \[GC\], no. 19867/12](#)**

**ARTICLE 6**

**Article 6 § 1 (Criminal)**

Criminal charge  
Access to court  
Fair hearing

Complaint about refusal by domestic court to re-open criminal proceedings following finding of a violation of Article 6 by European Court: *admissible*

Refusal by Supreme Court of request for revision of a criminal judgment further to a judgment of European Court finding a violation of Article 6: *no violation*

25.7.2017

[Carvalho Pinto de Sousa Morais v. Portugal, no. 17484/15](#)

**ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination (Article 8)

Reduction in damages award on grounds of sex and age of claimant: *violation*

19.12.2017

[Lopes de Sousa Fernandes v. Portugal \[GC\], no. 56080/13](#)

**ARTICLE 2**

Positive obligations

Alleged medical negligence resulting in patient's death: *no violation*

Failure to conduct adequate and timely inquiry into death resulting from suspected medical negligence: *violation*

Romania

5.9.2017

[Bărbulescu v. Romania \[GC\], no. 61496/08](#)

**ARTICLE 8**

Respect for private life

Respect for correspondence

Monitoring of an employee's use of the Internet at his place of work and use of data collected to justify his dismissal: *violation*

Russia

24.1.2017

[Khamtokhu and Aksenchik v. Russia \[GC\], nos. 60367/08 and 961/11](#)

**ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination (Article 5)

Alleged discrimination in provisions governing liability to life imprisonment: *no violations*

13.4.2017

[Tagayeva and Others v. Russia, nos. 26562/07 and 6 others](#)

**ARTICLE 2**

Use of force

Positive obligations (substantive aspect)

Effective investigation

Positive obligations (procedural aspect)

Breach of State's obligations to protect life during hostage taking crisis in Beslan in 2004 and lack of effective investigation: *violations*



### **ARTICLE 13**

Effective remedy

Special importance of compensation and access to information under Article 13:  
*no violation*

### **ARTICLE 46**

Execution of judgment – general measures  
Execution of judgment – individual measures

Respondent State to take measures to ensure adequate legal framework for use of lethal force during security operations

30.5.2017

#### **[Davydov and Others v. Russia, no. 75947/11](#)**

### **ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL NO. 1**

Free expression of the opinion of the people

Failure by domestic authorities to adequately investigate complaints of serious electoral irregularities: *violation*

20.6.2017

#### **[Bayev and Others v. Russia, nos. 67667/09 and 2 others](#)**

### **ARTICLE 10**

Freedom of expression

Legislative prohibition on the promotion of homosexuality among minors reinforcing stigma and prejudice and encouraging homophobia: *violation*

### **ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination (Article 10)

Unjustified difference in treatment between heterosexual majority and homosexual minority: *violation*

## Switzerland

10.1.2017

#### **[Osmanoğlu and Kocabaş v. Switzerland, no. 29086/12](#)**

### **ARTICLE 9**

Manifest religion or belief

Imposition of fine on parents for refusing, on religious grounds, to allow their daughters to attend compulsory mixed swimming lessons at their primary school: *no violation*

## Ukraine

12.10.2017

[\*\*Burmych and Others v. Ukraine \[GC\], nos. 46852/13 et al.\*\*](#)

### **ARTICLE 37**

Striking out applications

Continued examination of cases originating in systemic problem identified in *Yuriy Nikolayevich Ivanov v. Ukraine: struck out*

### **ARTICLE 46**

Pilot judgment pilote

Division of responsibility between the Court and the Committee of Ministers following failure to execute a pilot judgment

## United Kingdom

17.1.2017

[\*\*Hutchinson v. the United Kingdom \[GC\], no. 57592/08\*\*](#)

### **ARTICLE 3**

Inhuman or degrading punishment

Continued detention under whole life order following clarification of Secretary of State's powers to order release: *no violation*

13.6.2017

[\*\*Moohan and Gillon v. the United Kingdom \(dec.\), nos. 22962/15 and 23345/15\*\*](#)

### **ARTICLE 35**

#### **Article 35 § 3 (a)**

Competence *ratione materiae*

Referendum on Scottish Independence did not fall within scope of Article 3 of Protocol No. 1: *inadmissible*

15.6.2017

[\*\*Harkins v. the United Kingdom \(dec.\) \[GC\], no. 71537/14\*\*](#)

### **ARTICLE 35**

#### **Article 35 § 2 (b)**

Matter already examined by the Court

Development in Court's jurisprudence did not constitute "relevant new information" for purposes of Article 35 § 2 (b): *inadmissible*